

# Draft Minutes

## T11.3 FC-BB-6 ad hoc work group regular meeting

### 3 August 2011 – 9:00 AM to 5:30 PM MDT

### Edmonton, AB, Canada

The FC-BB-6 ad hoc work group of the Fibre Channel Protocol (T11.3) Task Group held a regular meeting at Edmonton, AB, Canada on 3 August 2011, hosted by the FCIA and Chris Lyon. Attendance was 23 people from 17 organizations, and one emeritus member. Attendance is tabulated at the end of this document.

Minutes were taken by Ralph Weber of ENDL Texas (roweber@ieee.org). Please report any corrections by e-mail to the T11.3 reflector at T11\_3@mail.T11.org.

## 1 Opening remarks and Introductions

Chairperson Claudio DeSanti (Cisco) opened the regular meeting Wednesday, 3 August 2011 at 9:00 AM MDT. The chair thanked the FCIA and Chris Lyon, our hosts for the meeting facilities, and led a round of introductions.

## 2 Meeting Policies

### 2.1 Attendance and Membership

The chair explained that attendance is recorded electronically at [www.t11.org/att](http://www.t11.org/att), and explained the procedure. Attendance at this meeting does not count toward attendance at the plenaries of T11 and its task groups (e.g., being here will not extricate an organization from membership jeopardy).

The chair stated that all persons present are considered members of this meeting and may vote on questions, limited to one vote per company present. He advised that although T11 does not limit participation in the activities of its work groups to representatives of T11 member organizations, it requires non-members to identify themselves as such. Non-members that anticipated continued participation in the activities of T11 were encouraged to become members.

Michael Ko (Huawei Symantec) identified himself as representing an organization that is not a member of T11.

### 2.2 IP Policy

The chair indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the ANSI intellectual property policies as specified in pages 1-3 of [http://www.incits.org/pat\\_slides.pdf](http://www.incits.org/pat_slides.pdf). He displayed these pages without comment or explanation, and directed that questions about the policy should be referred to the questioner's legal counsel or the ANSI General Counsel.

## 2.3 Antitrust

The chair indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the INCITS Anti-trust Guidelines (see <http://www.incits.org/inatrust.htm>). Anyone present at this meeting is responsible for objecting if he believes discussion in the meeting violates those guidelines. As examples, there should never be discussion of the following topics at any INCITS or INCITS subgroup meeting:

- Any company's prices or pricing policies;
- Specific R&D, sales and marketing plans;
- Any company's confidential product, product development or production strategies;
- Whether certain suppliers or customers will be served;
- Prices paid to input sources; or
- Complaints about individual firms or other actions that might tend to hinder a competitor in any market.

If such discussion is not immediately terminated, it is the chairperson's responsibility to terminate the meeting.

## 3 Administrivia

### 3.1 Approval of this Agenda

A draft agenda for the FC-BB-6 ad hoc work group regular meeting 3 August 2011 had been posted as T11/11-318v0, and revised to v1.

***Dave Peterson (Brocade) moved and Roger Hathorn (IBM) to accept T11/11-339v1 (v0 as modified) as the agenda for this regular meeting. Approved by acclamation.***

### 3.2 Approval of minutes

Minutes for the FC-BB-6 ad hoc work group regular meeting 8 June 2011 had been posted as T11/11-238v1.

***Lou Ricci (IBM) moved and Dave Peterson (Brocade) seconded to accept T11/11-238v1 as the minutes of the FC-BB-6 ad hoc work group meeting on 8 June 2011. Approved by acclamation.***

## 4 Review of old FC-BB-6 action items

FC-BB-6 old action items at the beginning of the regular meeting on 3 August 2011 —

- 110608-1 FC-BB-6 editor to incorporate T11/11-209v1 into FC-BB-6.  
**Carry. Last new revision of FC-BB-6 posted on 1 October 2010.**
- 110608-2 Craig Carlson to advise Claudio DeSanti that a proposal should detail how to terminate communication within a portion of a distributed FCF that has become isolated from its controlling FCF.  
**Closed as the result of the review of action items (i.e., reading the action item was taken as Claudio's notification).**
- 110608-3 Dave Peterson to initiate a proposal to clarify the behavior in the event of a lost link between FDFs that is restored quickly in comparison with the time it takes to coordinate with the controlling FCF.  
**Closed by T11/11-214v1.**
- 110608-4 Dave Peterson to initiate a proposal to require that each virtual domain shall have a unique switch name.  
**Closed by T11/11-217v1**

FC-BB-6 old action items at the beginning of the regular meeting on 3 August 2011 (Continued) —

- 110608-5 Dave Peterson to initiate a proposal to resolve the cases where two independent controlling FCFs are both configured and linked to the same FDF, including what happens in the event of other link failures.  
[Closed by T11/11-214v1.](#)
- 110608-6 Dave Peterson to initiate a proposal to require that the switch name for a virtual domain shall persist over all transitions from primary to secondary controlling FCFs.  
[Closed by T11/11-217v1.](#)

## 5 Old Business

No requests were made to reconsider old business during this meeting.

## 6 Scheduled FC-BB-6 business

### 6.1 FC-BB-5 Amendment 1 Project Proposal (11-295v0) Peterson (Brocade) (11-341v0) Black (EMC)

David Black reported that the FC Pseudo Wire RFC 6307 needs a published correct standard to reference (see T11/11-341v0). This was the motivation for starting the FC-BB-5 Amendment 1 project.

Dave Peterson presented the draft FC-BB-5 Amendment 1 project proposal (T11/11-295r0). Claudio DeSanti requested that “FC Pseudo Wire Updates” be added to the title. Dave expressed a concern that sending an odd title such as the one requested could make processing more difficult at INCITS.

Problems were identified in the references to existing standards section of the New Project Proposal, and Dave agree to prepare a new revision.

***Dave Peterson (Brocade) moved and David Black (EMC) seconded to accept T11/11-295v1 (v0 as modified) as the New Project Proposal for the FC-BB-5 Amendment 1, and that the FC-BB WG chair be instructed to present the revised New Project Proposal to T11.3 for forwarding to T11 and INCITS. The motion was approved 15:0:0.***

**Action Item 110803-1** Chair will present T11/11-295v1 to T11.3 as the New Project Proposal for the FC-BB-5 Amendment 1 for forwarding to T11 and INCITS.

### 6.2 Distributed FCF (11-026v2) DeSanti (Cisco) (11-346v0) DeSanti (Cisco)

Claudio DeSanti presented the proposed detailed text for Distributed FCFs (11-026v2). The group requested several changes and Claudio agreed to prepare a new revision.

Based on the FC-GS discussions the previous day, Claudio prepared several new model diagrams (11-346v0). The group stretched the model in several different dimensions, and Claudio took notes for future proposals. To further the discussion, Joe White presented the slides which the FC-GS group had reviewed (see agenda item 6.9).

Claudio closed the discussion of 11-346v0 by expressing a hope that converged terminology will be developed prior to the next meeting.

**6.3 VA\_Port Protocols (11-225v0) DeSanti (Cisco)**

Claudio DeSanti presented the detailed text proposal for VA\_Port protocols (11-225v0). The group requested several changes, and Claudio agreed to prepare a new revision.

**6.4 Controlling Switch Redundancy Protocol (11-224v0) DeSanti (Cisco)**

Claudio DeSanti presented the detailed text proposal for Controlling Switch Redundancy Protocol (11-224v0). The group requested several changes, and Claudio agreed to prepare a new revision.

**6.5 Summary of Virtual Domain Use Cases (11-214v1) Johnson (Brocade)**

Howard Johnson returned to his failure-mode case study (11-214v1) which was begun during the last meeting. The group discussed all the ambiguous behaviors that Howard raised as issues. Several agreements were reached. In a few cases, options (e.g., what timeout to use to allow civilized link debouncing) were identified for further study.

**6.6 Notification of Non-delivery (11-310v0) Johnson (Brocade)**

Howard Johnson presented a discussion of how FDFs might have to work harder to support Class 2 (11-310v0). The group discussed the hows and whys of Class 2 Reject support. Claudio noted several useful ideas for inclusion in October presentations.

RNID and RLS issues were noted for additional work in future presentations.

**6.7 Virtual Domain\_ID (11-309v0) Peterson (Brocade)**

Dave Peterson presented an overview of the recent Domain ID changes (11-309v0) in his detailed text (see agenda item 6.8).

**6.8 Virtual Domain text (11-217v1) Peterson (Brocade)**

Dave Peterson presented the latest revision of his Virtual Domain text (11-217v1). The group requested additional changes, and Dave agreed to prepare a new revision.

**6.9 Changes to the Fabric Configuration Server Model (11-220v1) White (Juniper)**

Joe White reviewed the Fabric Configuration Server model problems which are causing troubles in the FC-GS WG (11-220v1). No significant questions were raised in response to Joe's presentation.

**7 Unscheduled FC-BB-6 Business**

No unscheduled business was presented.

**8 Review of Action Items**

FC-BB-6 action items at the end of the regular meeting on 3 August 2011 —

- 110608-1 FC-BB-6 editor to incorporate T11/11-209v1 into FC-BB-6.
- 110803-1 Chair will present T11/11-295v1 to T11.3 as the New Project Proposal for the FC-BB-5 Amendment 1 for forwarding to T11 and INCITS.

## 9 Meeting Schedule

Request 8 hours at the T11 plenary week hosted by FCIA in Albuquerque, NM, 3–7 October 2011.

## 10 Attendance Check and Adjournment

The chair reminded those present to sign in online (see agenda item 2.1).

The regular meeting was adjourned at 5:35 PM MDT on 3 August 2011, by declaration of the chair.

## Attendance

<u>Organization</u>	<u>Representative</u>
BROADCOM	Pat Thaler
BROCADE	David Peterson
BROCADE	Steven L. Wilson
CISCO SYSTEMS, INC.	Claudio DeSanti
EMC	David Black
EMC	Erik Smith
EMC	Gary S. Robinson
ENDL TEXAS	Ralph Weber
HEWLETT-PACKARD	Barry Maskas
HUAWEI SYMANTEC	Michael Ko
IBM	Louis Ricci
IBM	Roger Hathorn
IBM	Scott Carlson
INTEL CORPORATION	Prafulla Deuskar
JDSU	Jason Rusch
JUNIPER	Joseph White
LSI CORP.	John Lohmeyer
MELLANOX TECH.	Diego Crupnicoff
NETAPP	Frederick Knight
ORACLE	Michael Roy
ORACLE	Roger Dickerson
QLOGIC CORP.	Craig W. Carlson
EMERITUS	Horst Truestedt