

Draft Minutes

T11.3 FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group teleconference

26 May 2009 - 11 AM to 12 PM PDT

The FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group of the Fibre Channel Protocol (T11.3) Task Group held a teleconference on 26 May 2009, hosted by Cisco. Attendance was 16 people from 11 organizations and is tabulated at the end of this document.

Minutes were taken by Bob Nixon (Emulex) (bob.nixon@emulex.com). Please report any corrections by email to the T11.3 reflector at T11_3@mail.T11.org.

1 Opening remarks

1.1 Introductions

Chairperson Claudio DeSanti (Cisco) opened the teleconference Wednesday, 26 May 2009 at 11:07 AM PDT. He explained that attendance is recorded electronically at www.t11.org/att, and that the list would serve as introductions of those present as well.

2 Meeting Policy

2.1 Patents

The chair indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the ANSI intellectual property policies as specified in pages 1-3 of http://www.incits.org/pat_slides.pdf

2.2 Antitrust

The chair indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the INCITS Antitrust Guidelines. The INCITS Antitrust Guidelines are available at

<http://www.incits.org/inatrust.htm>

3 Administrivia

3.1 Approval of Agenda

The agenda for this meeting was announced in the meeting posting as continued review of proposed resolutions to FC-BB-5 letter ballot comments. This agenda was accepted without objection.

3.2 Review of Minutes

Minutes for the following FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group meetings have been posted:

- a) meeting 1 April 2009 as T11/09-232v0;
- b) teleconference 16 April 2009 as T11/09-245v1;
- c) teleconference 27 April 2009 as T11/09-257v0;

- d) teleconference 11 May 2009 as T11/09-267v0; and
- e) teleconference 15 May 2009 as T11/09-273v0.

Review of minutes was deferred until the next regular meeting.

4 Review of Old Action Items

Review of incomplete action items was deferred until the next regular meeting.

5 Presentations relevant to letter ballot comment resolution

5.1 David Black's response to EMC-077 T11/09-244v2 Black (EMC)

This proposal was mistakenly left open after its review at an earlier meeting. It was clarified that there were no remaining issues with this proposal and that its recommendations were incorporated to close EMC-077.

5.2 FIP VLAN discovery updates T11/09-291v0 Thaler (Broadcom)

This proposal introduces several corrections and a few clarifications to the specification for FIP VLAN Discovery.

An optional parameter was proposed for a FIP VLAN Discovery Request that carries a Name_Identifier related to the requester. It is intended that this could be used to filter responses.

It was agreed to add text that an FCF should return all VLANS on which it offers FC-BB_E service, and that it may filter based on requester identity.

It was agreed to add text to clarify that if FIP VLAN Discovery is performed, it shall be performed before FIP FCF Discovery. This closes EMC-Late-001.

It was proposed to require support for FPMA and allow support for SPMA.

It was agreed to clarify that the proposed requirement to support FPMA was a requirement to implement, not a requirement to use.

Other than the mandatory FPMA, the rest was accepted. The revised FPMA text will be brought for review at the next regular meeting.

5.3 Link Incident Text T11/09-274v0 Peterson (Brocade)

This proposal offers detailed text in support of the concept approved in T11/09-264v0.

A minor rewording of the description of the FC-BB_E error interval was debated extensively before agreement was reached.

A few other editorial corrections were agreed.

This proposal as modified was accepted as closing IBM-021.

6 Review of Action Items

Review of incomplete action items was deferred until the next regular meeting. Incomplete action items are listed here for convenience of the reader.

- 090401-1 David Black to review Annex D of FC-BB-5 1.05.
- 090401-2 Claudio DeSanti to publish a new document reflecting T11/09-200v0 amended as agreed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 1 April 2009.
(Completed by posting of T11/09-200v1)
- 090401-3 FC-BB-5 editor to check all uses of "FCoE frame" to assure that they do not exceed the scope of the definition of FCoE frame.
(Completed by posting of T11/09-251v0)
- 090401-4 Claudio DeSanti to publish T11/09-201v0, reflecting the unpublished draft developed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 1 April 2009.
(Completed by posting of T11/09-201v0)
- 090401-5 FC-BB-5 chair to request T11.3 to request T11 to acquire a private enterprise number from IANA for use in standards developed by T11.
(Completed by posting of T11/09-250v0)
- 090401-6 FC-BB-5 secretary to send email to the T11.3 reflector advising that the FC-BB-5 work group expects to adopt specifications based on T11/09-204v0, which includes different definitions of the LESB counters in FCoE than those in FC-FS-3.
(Completed by email 21 April 2009, Nixon to T11.2 and T11.3 distributions)
- 090401-7 Silvano Gai to post a T11 proposal documenting the pre-FIP implementation.
- 090401-8 FC-BB-5 chair to schedule up to 5 teleconferences to discuss resolutions to open technical issues.
(Completed by postings on the T11 web site)
- 090427-1 Dave Peterson to prepare proposed text for incorporation of proposal T11/09-204v2, amended as agreed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group teleconference 27 April 2009, and post that text for review at the FC-BB-5 teleconference 11 May 2009.
(Completed by posting of T11/09-262v0)
- 090427-2 FC-BB-5 Editor to incorporate T11/09-251v0, amended as agreed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group teleconference 27 April 2009, into FC-BB-5.
(Completed by posting of FC-BB-5 draft revision 1.06, T11/09-056v2)
- 090427-3 FC-BB-5 Editor to prepare a new revision of FC-BB-5 and post it for review at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group teleconference 11 May 2009.
(Completed by posting of FC-BB-5 draft revision 1.06, T11/09-056v2)
- 090515-1 FC-BB-5 Editor to propose detailed text changes to specify the technical approach described in T11/09-264v0.
(Completed by posting of T11/09-274v0)

7 Meeting Schedule

Five hours have been scheduled on Wednesday June 3 at the T11 plenary week hosted by FCIA in Coeur d'Alene ID, 1-5 June 2009.

8 Adjournment

The teleconference was adjourned by unanimous disconnection at 12:07 PM PDT on 26 May 2009.

9 Status of Open Proposals

Closures will be carried until the next regular meeting.

Document Title	Number	Disposition	Author
Letter Ballot Comment database	T11/09-010	Carry for continued comment resolution. Latest version presented was T11/09-010v8	Peterson (Brocade)
FCoE Link Error Status Block	T11/09-204	Close, last presented version was T11/09-204v2. Replaced by T11/09-262.	Hathorn (IBM)
David Black's response to EMC-077	T11/09-244	Close, accepted version wasf T11/09-244v2.	Black EMC
FCoE frame or FCoE PDU?	T11/09-251	Close. Version accepted was T11/09-251v0 with a minor change.	DeSanti (Cisco)
Private Enterprise Number for FCoE MIB	T11/09-250	Close. Version accepted was T11/09-250v0.	DeSanti (Cisco)
LESB Text	T11/09-262	Close. Version accepted was T11/09-262v1 with a minor revision.	Peterson (Brocade)
FCoE Link Incidents	T11/09-264v0	Close, last version presented was T11/09-264v0. Replaced by T11/09-274v0.	Hathorn (IBM)
Link Incident Text	T11/09-274	Close, accepted version was T11/09-274v0 with changes.	Peterson (Brocade)
FIP VLAN discovery updates	T11/09-291	Carry for regular meeting discusssion of one point. Version presented was T11/09-291v0.	Thaler (Broadcom)

10 Attendance

Organization	Representative
BROADCOM	Pat Thaler
BROCADE	Anoop Ghanwani
BROCADE	David Peterson
CISCO	Joe Pelissier
CISCO SYSTEMS	Fabrizio Corno
CISCO SYSTEMS	Silvano Gai
CISCO SYSTEMS, INC.	Claudio DeSanti
DELL	Gaurav Chawla
EMC	David Black
EMULEX	Bob Nixon
HCL TECHNOLOGIES LTD.	Prakash Venkatesen
HUFFERD ENTERPRISES	John Hufferd
IBM	Roger Hathorn
NETAPP	Frederick Knight
QLOGIC CORP	Alan Spalding
QLOGIC CORP.	Craig W. Carlson