

Draft Minutes

T11.3 FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group teleconference

11 May 2009 - 11 AM to 12 PM PDT

The FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group of the Fibre Channel Protocol (T11.3) Task Group held a teleconference on 11 May 2009, hosted by Cisco. Attendance was 13 people from 9 organizations and is tabulated at the end of this document.

Minutes were taken by Bob Nixon (Emulex) (bob.nixon@emulex.com). Please report any corrections by email to the T11.3 reflector at T11_3@mail.T11.org.

1 Opening remarks

1.1 Introductions

Chairperson Claudio DeSanti (Cisco) opened the teleconference Wednesday, 11 May 2009 at 11:05 AM PDT. He advised that attendance and introductions would rely on the meeting attendance facility at www.t11.org/att.

2 Administrivia

2.1 Approval of Agenda

The agenda announced for this meeting was to continue resolution of T11 letter ballot comments against FC-BB-5. This agenda was approved by unanimous acquiescence.

2.2 Review of Minutes

Minutes for the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group meeting 1 April 2009 have been posted as T11/09-232v0. Minutes for the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group teleconference 16 April 2009 have been posted as T11/09-245v1. Minutes for the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group teleconference 27 April 2009 have been posted as T11/09-257v0. Review of minutes was deferred until the next regular meeting.

3 Review of Old Action Items

Review of incomplete action items was deferred until the next regular meeting.

4 Presentations relevant to letter ballot comment resolution

4.1 LESB Text

T11/09-262v0

Peterson (Brocade)

It was agreed to remove text claiming the LESB is maintained by PN_Ports and Fx_Ports in the third paragraph of 7.10.

It was noted that the term virtual links failure is referenced but is not defined in FC-BB-5 or the proposal, but is referenced.

It was agreed that the descriptions of the virtual link timeouts in FC-BB-5 7.8.4 will add that these events will be counted as virtual link failures.

It was agreed that the description of the relation of the Errored Block Count to the 802.3 errored blocks counter was ambiguous. Several suggested changes were all found less than satisfactory. The presenter will try to reword it to satisfy the group.

Additional editorial corrections were requested by the group.

5 FCoE Link Incidents

T11/09-264v0

Hathorn (IBM)

Precedence having been given to the editor's questions concerning implementation of previously approved comment resolutions, time did not allow discussion of this proposal. The group was requested to review this document prior to the next meeting.

5.1 David Black's response to EMC-077

T11/09-244v2

Black (EMC)

Precedence having been given to the editor's questions concerning implementation of previously approved comment resolutions, time did not allow discussion of this proposal. The group was requested to review this document prior to the next meeting.

6 Editor's questions on letter ballot comments

T11/09-010v8

Peterson (Brocade)

The editor had highlighted certain comment resolutions in this version of the comment resolution document, and questioned the intent of the group.

EMC-041: The editor's question will be resolved offline with the proposers of the the resolution.

Solution Technology-055: The previously accepted change resolves an issue that appears to be clearly resolved in existing context. It was agreed to change the details of the resolution to add a reference to EtherType rather than replacing the current terminology.

Solution Technology-056 and Solution Technology-057: It was agreed that new text in the draft, though different from the approved text, nevertheless resolves the issue satisfactorily.

Late-002: It was agreed this has been resolved. the comment required an exhaustive search to fix any instances of a terminology error. It was reported that the search was completed and no further instances of the error were found.

It was agreed to add a late letter ballot comment that the standard does not provide clear direction as to when the VLAN Discovery protocol should be performed relative to other protocols. Possible resolutions werre discussed. There were volunteers to prepare proposed text.

Review of incomplete action items was deferred until the next regular meeting. Incomplete action items are listed here for convenience of the reader.

090401-1 David Black to review Annex D of FC-BB-5 1.05.

090401-2 Claudio DeSanti to publish a new document reflecting T11/09-200v0 amended as agreed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 1 April 2009.
(Completed by posting of T11/09-200v1)

- 090401-3 FC-BB-5 editor to check all uses of "FCoE frame" to assure that they do not exceed the scope of the definition of FCoE frame.
(Completed by posting of T11/09-251v0)
- 090401-4 Claudio DeSanti to publish T11/09-201v0, reflecting the unpublished draft developed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 1 April 2009.
(Completed by posting of T11/09-201v0)
- 090401-5 FC-BB-5 chair to request T11.3 to request T11 to acquire a private enterprise number from IANA for use in standards developed by T11.
(Completed by posting of T11/09-250v0)
- 090401-6 FC-BB-5 secretary to send email to the T11.3 reflector advising that the FC-BB-5 work group expects to adopt specifications based on T11/09-204v0, which includes different definitions of the LESB counters in FCoE than those in FC-FS-3.
(Completed by email 21 April 2009, Nixon to T11.2 and T11.3 distributions)
- 090401-7 Silvano Gai to post a T11 proposal documenting the pre-FIP implementation.
- 090401-8 FC-BB-5 chair to schedule up to 5 teleconferences to discuss resolutions to open technical issues.
(Completed by postings on the T11 web site)
- 090427-1 Dave Peterson to prepare proposed text for incorporation of proposal T11/09-204v2, amended as agreed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group teleconference 27 April 2009, and post that text for review at the FC-BB-5 teleconference 11 May 2009.
(Completed by posting of T11/09-262v0)
- 090427-2 FC-BB-5 Editor to incorporate T11/09-251v0, amended as agreed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group teleconference 27 April 2009, into FC-BB-5.
(Completed by posting of FC-BB-5 draft revision 1.06, T11/09-056v2)
- 090427-3 FC-BB-5 Editor to prepare a new revision of FC-BB-5 and post it for review at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group teleconference 11 May 2009.
(Completed by posting of FC-BB-5 draft revision 1.06, T11/09-056v2)

7 Meeting Schedule

7.1 Interim meetings

The following teleconferences have been scheduled:

- 11 AM - 12 PM PDT Friday 15 May 2009
- 11 AM - 12 PM PDT Tuesday 26 May 2009

7.2 Next Plenary Week

Five hours have been scheduled on Wednesday June 3 at the T11 plenary week hosted by FCIA in Coeur d'Alene ID, 1-5 June 2009.

8 Adjournment

The teleconference was adjourned by unanimous disconnection at 12:05 PM PDT on 11 May 2009.

9 Status of Open Proposals

Document Title	Number	Disposition	Author
Letter Ballot Comment database	T11/09-010	Carry for continued comment resolution. Latest version presented was T11/09-010v8	Peterson (Brocade)
FCoE Link Error Status Block	T11/09-204	Closed, replaced by T11/09-262.. Last presented version of T11/09-204 was T11/09-204v2.	Hathorn (IBM)
David Black's response to EMC-077	T11/09-244	Carry, discussion of T11/09-244v2 was deferred.	Black EMC
FCoE frame or FCoE PDU?	T11/09-251	Close. Version accepted was T11/09-251v0 with a minor change.	DeSanti (Cisco)
Private Enterprise Number for FCoE MIB	T11/09-250	Close. Version accepted was T11/09-250v0.	DeSanti (Cisco)
LESB Text	T11/09-262	Carry for review of a pending revision. Version presented was T11/09-262v0.	Peterson (Brocade)
FCoE Link Incidents	T11/09-264	Carry, discussion of T11/09-264v0 was deferred.	Hathorn (IBM)

10 Attendance

Organization	Representative
BROCADE	Anoop Ghanwani
BROCADE	David Peterson
CISCO SYSTEMS	Fabrizio Corno
CISCO SYSTEMS	Landon Noll
CISCO SYSTEMS, INC.	Claudio DeSanti
DELL	Gaurav Chawla
EMC	David Black
EMULEX	Bob Nixon
HUFFERD ENTERPRISES	John Hufferd
IBM	Roger Hathorn
NETAPP	Frederick Knight
QLOGIC CORP	Alan Spalding
QLOGIC CORP.	Craig W. Carlson