

Draft Minutes

T11.3 FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group teleconference

16 April 2009 - 11 AM-12 PM PDT

version 1 Added attendees who were unable to sign in electronically during the meeting.

The FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group of the Fibre Channel Protocol (T11.3) Task Group held a teleconference on 16 April 2009, hosted by Cisco. Attendance was 15 people from 10 organizations and is tabulated at the end of this document.

Minutes were taken by Bob Nixon (Emulex) (bob.nixon@emulex.com). Please report any corrections by email to the T11.3 reflector at T11_3@mail.T11.org.

1 Opening remarks

1.1 Introductions

Chairperson Claudio DeSanti (Cisco) opened the teleconference Thursday, 16 April 2009 at 11:08 AM PDT. He thanked our host organization, Cisco, and led a round of introductions.

2 Meeting Policy

2.1 Attendance and Membership

The chair explained that attendance is recorded electronically at www.t11.org/att, and explained the procedure. Attendance at this meeting does not count toward attendance at the plenaries of T11 and its task groups (i.e., being here will not get you out or keep you out of membership jeopardy).

The chair stated that all persons present are considered members of this meeting and may vote on questions, limited to one vote per company present. He advised that although T11 does not limit participation in the activities of its work groups to representatives of T11 member organizations, it requires nonmembers to identify themselves as such. Nonmembers that expect they may participate in the activities of T11 regularly were encouraged to become members.

Those responding are included in the attendance record. They were advised that by remaining in this meeting, they submit themselves and their organizations to INCITS policy for intellectual property, antitrust, and guest membership policy.

2.2 Patents

The chair indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the ANSI intellectual property policies as specified in pages 1-3 of http://www.incits.org/pat_slides.pdf. He displayed these pages without comment or explanation, and directed that questions about the policy should be referred to the questioner's legal counsel or the ANSI General Counsel.

2.3 Antitrust

The chair indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the INCITS Antitrust Guidelines. Any member of the meeting is responsible for objecting if he believes discussion in the meeting violates those guidelines. As examples, there should never be discussion of the following topics at any INCITS or INCITS subgroup meeting:

- Any company's prices or pricing policies;
- Specific R&D, sales and marketing plans;
- Any company's confidential product, product development or production strategies;
- Whether certain suppliers or customers will be served;
- Prices paid to input sources; or
- Complaints about individual firms or other actions that might tend to hinder a competitor in any market.

If such discussion is not immediately terminated, it is the chairperson's responsibility to terminate the meeting. The INCITS Antitrust Guidelines are available at

<http://www.incits.org/inatrust.htm>

3 Administrivia

3.1 Approval of Agenda

The announced agenda was to review any proposals that had been posted in response to letter ballot comment resolution actions. This agenda was accepted by acclamation.

3.2 Review of Minutes

Minutes for the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group teleconference 1 April 2009 have been posted as T11/09-232v0. Review of minutes was deferred until the next regular meeting.

4 Review of Old Action Items

Review of old action items was deferred until the next regular meeting.

5 Old Business

5.1 FCoE Link Error Status Block

T11/09-204v1

Hathorn (IBM)

Roger presented an update to an earlier proposal for the mapping of FC-BB_E conditions to the Fibre Channel Link Error Status Block (LESB). He had incorporated feedback from Ethernet experts in the community.

The presenter pointed out that the mapping of most counters does not maintain the semantics of the Fibre Channel LESB counters. This reflects that FC and FCoE do not in general have similar interesting link conditions. This difference in LESB was accepted by those present.

The presenter will take into account advice from those present on possible additional changes.

The presenter was advised to make his changes as a new subclause at the end of clause 7, make the mappings normative for devices that support the RLS ELS, and to require those devices that do not support the normative mapping to reject an RLS ELS.

The presenter will prepare a new revision of the presentation for the next teleconference.

6 Scheduled Business

6.1 David Black's response to EMC-077

T11/09-244v0

Black (EMC)

This presentation proposes several normative additions to the body of FC-BB-5 that he found necessary to support the informative requirements in annex D.

David accepted advice on some issues not fully resolved in the presentation.

Those present approved the presentation as modified.

The presenter will prepare a new revision of the presentation reflecting its approved content. This closes comment EMC-077.

7 Review of Action Items

Review of action items was deferred until the next regular meeting. They are recorded here for the convenience of readers:

- 090401-1 David Black to review Annex D of FC-BB-5 1.05.
- 090401-2 Claudio DeSanti to publish a new document reflecting T11/09-200v0 amended as agreed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 1 April 2009.
- 090401-3 FC-BB-5 editor to check all uses of "FCoE frame" to assure that they do not exceed the scope of the definition of FCoE frame.
- 090401-4 Claudio DeSanti to publish T11/09-201v0, reflecting the unpublished draft developed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 1 April 2009.
(Completed by posting of T11/09-201v0)
- 090401-5 FC-BB-5 chair to request T11.3 to request T11 to acquire a private enterprise number from IANA for use in standards developed by T11.
- 090401-6 FC-BB-5 secretary to send email to the T11.3 reflector advising that the FC-BB-5 work group expects to adopt specifications based on T11/09-204v0, which includes different definitions of the LESB counters in FCoE than those in FC-FS-3.
- 090401-7 Silvano Gai to post a T11 proposal documenting the pre-FIP implementation.
- 090401-8 FC-BB-5 chair to schedule up to 5 teleconferences to discuss resolutions to open technical issues.

8 Meeting Schedule

8.1 Interim meetings

The following teleconferences have been scheduled:

- 11 AM - 12 PM PDT Monday 27 April 2009
- 11 AM - 12 PM PDT Monday 11 May 2009
- 11 AM - 12 PM PDT Friday 15 May 2009
- 11 AM - 12 PM PDT Tuesday 26 May 2009

8.2 Next Plenary Week

Five hours have been scheduled on Wednesday June 3 at the T11 plenary week hosted by FCIA in Coeur d'Alene ID, 1-5 June 2009.

9 Adjournment

The teleconference was adjourned at 12:22 PM PDT on 16 April 2009.

10 Status of Open Proposals

Document Title	Number	Disposition	Author
Letter Ballot Comment database	T11/09-010	Carry for continued comment resolution. Latest version presented was T11/09-010v5	Peterson (Brocade)
FCoE Link Error Status Block	T11/09-204	Carry for continued discussion.. Version presented was T11/09-204v1.	Hathorn (IBM)
David Black's response to EMC-077	T11/09-244	Closed. Version approved was T11/09-244v1.	Black (EMC)

11 Attendance

Organization	Representative
BROADCOM	Pat Thaler
BROCADE	Anoop Ghanwani
BROCADE	David Peterson
CISCO SYSTEMS	Fabrizio Corno
CISCO SYSTEMS	Silvano Gai
CISCO SYSTEMS, INC.	Claudio DeSanti
CISCO SYSTEMS	Landon Noll
EMC	David Black
EMULEX	Bob Nixon
HCL TECHNOLOGIES	Prakash Venkatesen
HCL TECHNOLOGIES	Mahendaran PV
IBM	Roger Hathorn
MELLANOX TECHNOLOGIES	Diego Crupnicoff
NETAPP	Frederick Knight
QLOGIC CORP	Alan Spalding
QLOGIC CORP.	Craig W. Carlson
HUFFERD ENTERPRISES	John Hufferd