

Draft Minutes

T11.3 FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting

1 April 2009 - 9:00 AM to 4:30 PM CDT

Memphis TN

version 1 Corrected spelling errors

The FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group of the Fibre Channel Protocol (T11.3) Task Group held a regular meeting at Memphis TN on 1 April 2009, hosted by Brocade. Attendance was 30 people from 21 organizations and is tabulated at the end of this document.

Minutes were taken by Bob Nixon (Emulex) (bob.nixon@emulex.com). Please report any corrections by email to the T11.3 reflector at T11_3@mail.T11.org.

1 Opening remarks

1.1 Introductions

Chairperson Claudio DeSanti (Cisco) opened the regular meeting Wednesday, 1 April 2009 at 9:10 AM CDT. He thanked our host organization, Brocade, and led a round of introductions.

2 Meeting Policy

2.1 Attendance and Membership

The chair explained that attendance is recorded electronically at www.t11.org/att, and explained the procedure. Attendance at this meeting does not count toward attendance at the plenaries of T11 and its task groups (i.e., being here will not get you out or keep you out of membership jeopardy).

The chair stated that all persons present are considered members of this meeting and may vote on questions, limited to one vote per company present. He advised that although T11 does not limit participation in the activities of its work groups to representatives of T11 member organizations, it requires nonmembers to identify themselves as such. Nonmembers that expect they may participate in the activities of T11 regularly were encouraged to become members.

2.2 Patents

The chair indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the ANSI intellectual property policies as specified in pages 1-3 of http://www.incits.org/pat_slides.pdf. He displayed these pages without comment or explanation, and directed that questions about the policy should be referred to the questioner's legal counsel or the ANSI General Counsel.

2.3 Antitrust

The chair indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the INCITS Antitrust Guidelines. Any member of the meeting is responsible for objecting if he believes discussion in the

meeting violates those guidelines. As examples, there should never be discussion of the following topics at any INCITS or INCITS subgroup meeting:

- Any company's prices or pricing policies;
- Specific R&D, sales and marketing plans;
- Any company's confidential product, product development or production strategies;
- Whether certain suppliers or customers will be served;
- Prices paid to input sources; or
- Complaints about individual firms or other actions that might tend to hinder a competitor in any market.

If such discussion is not immediately terminated, it is the chairperson's responsibility to terminate the meeting. The INCITS Antitrust Guidelines are available at

<http://www.incits.org/inatrust.htm>

3 Administrivia

3.1 Approval of Agenda

An agenda for the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 1 April 2009 has been posted as T11/09-166v0.

It was agreed to add a discussion of Reliable Error Message Delivery for FCoE (T11/09-207v0) as requested by Landon Noll and Craig Carlson.

It was agreed to add a discussion of Roger Hathorn's response IBM-020 (T11/09-204v0) as requested by Roger Hathorn.

Bill Martin (Emulex) moved and Craig Carlson (QLogic) seconded to accept T11/09-166v0 with the changes noted above as the agenda for this regular meeting. Approved unanimously.

3.2 Review of Minutes

Minutes for the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 4 February 2009 have been posted as T11/09-088v0.

Minutes for the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 3 March 2009 have been posted as T11/09-131v1.

Bob Nixon (Emulex) moved and Fred Knight (NetApp) seconded to accept T11/09-088v0 as the minutes of the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group meeting on 4 February 2009 and to accept T11/09-131v1 as the minutes of the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group meeting on 3 March 2009. Approved unanimously.

4 Review of Old Action Items

- 090204-1 David Black SHALL review Claudio's use of "shall", "should", and "may" when Claudio posts his rewrite of subclause 7.7.
(Completed by item 6.3 on this agenda)
- 090204-2 David Black to bring in a proposal for reasonable checks FCFs shall make for MAC Address duplication.
(Completed by item 6.3 on this agenda)

090304-1 David Black to provide IETF FC Pseudowire references.
(Completed by email, see FC-BB-5 1.05)

090304-2 Dave Peterson to prepare a new draft of FC-BB-5 incorporating T11/09-117v1, "FC-BB-5 Annex C Updated", and "FC-BB-5 Annex D Updated".
(Completed by email, see FC-BB-5 1.05)

Given the above resolution, David Black requested the following action:

ACTION David Black to review Annex D of FC-BB-5 1.05.

5 Old Business

No old business was presented.

6 Scheduled Business

6.1 FCoE Corollary to MD's Disappearing DJ Problem T11/09-199v0 Weber (ENDL)

This presentation proposed certain extensions to the RLS ELS to report statistics related to the development of FCoE.

Fred Knight (NetApp) moved and Bill Martin (Emulex) seconded to not incorporate T11/09-199v0 as a resolution to one or more letter ballot comments on FC-BB-5. Landon Noll (Cisco) invoked the two-week rule, and the motion was withdrawn.

6.2 FC-BB-5 Figure 4 T11/09-200v0 DeSanti (T11/Cisco)

The presentation proposed two options for an FCoE model diagram for the FC-BB-5 Structure and Concepts clause. Claudio accepted an editorial improvement.

Fred Knight (NetApp) moved and Ralph Weber (ENDL Texas) seconded to accept option a) of T11/09-200v0 amended as agreed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 1 April 2009 as a resolution to one or more letter ballot comments on FC-BB-5. The motion passed unanimously.

ACTION Claudio DeSanti to publish a new document reflecting T11/09-200v0 amended as agreed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 1 April 2009.

6.3 David Black's response to EMC-038 and EMC-073 (unpublished) Black (EMC)

This presentation offered text changes that would satisfy certain concerns expressed by the presenter during letter ballot. Changes requested by the group were captured.

ACTION FC-BB-5 editor to check all uses of "FCoE frame" to assure that they do not exceed the scope of the definition of FCoE frame.

It was agreed to accept the document with the requested changes as the resolution of letter ballot comments EMC-038 and EMC-073.

ACTION Claudio DeSanti to publish T11/09-201v0, reflecting the unpublished draft developed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 1 April 2009.

6.8 FC-BB-5 Letter Ballot Comments

T11/09-010v5

DeSanti (Cisco)

Silvano Gai (Cisco) moved and Larry Lamers (VMWare) seconded to hold a vote on whether an informative annex describing pre-FIP implementation is necessary.

After protracted contention, a friendly amendment was made (“Gentlemen, gentlemen, there will be no fighting in the war room!”) to modify the motion to

Silvano Gai (Cisco) moved and Larry Lamers (VMWare) seconded that an informative annex describing the pre-FIP implementation should be added to FC-BB-5. The motion failed with 3 favoring, 5 opposing, and 8 abstaining.

ACTION Silvano Gai to post a T11 proposal documenting the pre-FIP implementation.

3 technical comments remain open, and 9 editorial comments have been left tot the discretion of the editor.

7 Unscheduled Business

No unscheduled business was presented.

8 Project Schedule

Milestone	Expected date
Last Technical Input	June 2008
T11 letter Ballot	October 2008
Forward to INCITS	June 2009

9 Review of Action Items

- 090401-1 David Black to review Annex D of FC-BB-5 1.05.
- 090401-2 Claudio DeSanti to publish a new document reflecting T11/09-200v0 amended as agreed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 1 April 2009.
- 090401-3 FC-BB-5 editor to check all uses of “FCoE frame” to assure that they do not exceed the scope of the definition of FCoE frame.
- 090401-4 Claudio DeSanti to publish T11/09-201v0, reflecting the unpublished draft developed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 1 April 2009.
(Completed by posting of T11/09-201v0)
- 090401-5 FC-BB-5 chair to request T11.3 to request T11 to acquire a private enterprise number from IANA for use in standards developed by T11.
- 090401-6 FC-BB-5 secretary to send email to the T11.3 reflector advising that the FC-BB-5 work group expects to adopt specifications based on T11/09-204v0, which includes different definitions of the LESB counters in FCoE than those in FC-FS-3.

090401-7 Silvano Gai to post a T11 proposal documenting the pre-FIP implementation.

090401-8 FC-BB-5 chair to schedule up to 5 teleconferences to discuss resolutions to open technical issues.

10 Meeting Schedule

10.1 Interim request

ACTION FC-BB-5 chair to schedule up to 5 teleconferences to discuss resolutions to open technical issues.

10.2 Next Plenary Week

Request 6 hours at the T11 plenary week hosted by FCIA in Coeur d'Alene ID, 1-5 June 2009.

11 Adjournment

Bill Martin (Emulex) moved and Horst Truustedt (TrueFocus) seconded to adjourn. Approved unanimously.

The regular meeting was adjourned at 3:45 PM CDT on 1 April 2009.

12 Status of Open Proposals

Document Title	Number	Disposition	Author
Letter Ballot Comment database	T11/09-010	Carry for continued comment resolution. Latest version presented was T11/09-010v5	Peterson (Brocade)
MIB Concern resolutions	T11/09-068	Close. Replaced by.T11/09-067v1.	Pelissier (Cisco), Peterson (Brocade)
MIB Proposal	T11/09-067	Close. Version accepted was T11/09-067v1	Pelissier (Cisco)
FCoE Corollary to MD's Disappearing DJ Problem	T11/09-199	Close, withdrawn. Version presented was T11/09-199v0.	Weber (ENDL)
FC-BB-5 Figure 4	T11/09-200	Close. Version accepted was T11/09-200v0	DeSanti (T11/Cisco)
FCoE: MIB Module Proposal Overview	T11/09-155	Close, tutorial only. Version presented was T11/09-155v0	Pelissier (Cisco)
David Black's response to EMC-038 and EMC-073	T11/09-201	Close. Version accepted was T11/09-201v0.	Black (EMC)
Reliable Error Message Deliver for FCoE.	T11/09-207	Close, deferred to a later project. Version presented was T11/09-207v0.	Noll (Cisco), Carlson (QLogic)

13 Attendance

Organization	Representative
BLADE NETWORK TECHNOLOGIES	Chetan Yaliwal
BROCADE	Anoop Ghanwani
BROCADE	David Peterson
CISCO SYSTEMS	Joe Pelissier
CISCO SYSTEMS	Landon Noll
CISCO SYSTEMS	Silvano Gai
CISCO SYSTEMS	Claudio DeSanti
DATA STORAGE INSTITUTE A*STAR	Khin Mi Mi Aung
EMC	David Black
EMC	Erik Smith
EMC	Gary S. Robinson
EMULEX	Bob Nixon
EMULEX	William R. Martin
ENDL TEXAS	Ralph Weber
FINISAR	Jason Rusch
HUAWEI TECHNOLOGIES (USA)	Yijun Xiong
IBM	Louis Ricci
IBM	Roger Hathorn
IBM	Scott Carlson
LSI CORP.	John Lohmeyer
MICROSOFT	Albert Chen
NETAPP	Frederick Knight
PMC-SIERRA	Brian L'Ecuyer
QLOGIC.	Craig W. Carlson
SOLUTION TECHNOLOGY	Robert Kembel
SUN MICROSYSTEMS	Roger Dickerson
SYMANTEC	Roger Cummings
TRUE FOCUS	Horst Truestedt
VIRTUAL INSTRUMENTS	Joseph R. Mathis
VMWARE	Lawrence Lamers