

# Draft Minutes

## T11.3 FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting

### 4 February 2009 - 9 AM to 12 PM CST

### San Antonio TX

The FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group of the Fibre Channel Protocol (T11.3) Task Group held a regular meeting at San Antonio TX on 4 February 2009, hosted by HP and Sean Fitzpatrick. Attendance was 32 people from 22 organizations and is tabulated at the end of this document.

Minutes were taken by Bob Nixon (Emulex) (bob.nixon@emulex.com). Please report any corrections by email to the T11.3 reflector at T11\_3@mail.T11.org.

## 1 Opening remarks

### 1.1 Introductions

Chairperson Claudio DeSanti (Cisco) opened the regular meeting Wednesday, 4 February 2009 at 9:13 AM CST. He thanked our host organization, HP and Sean Fitzpatrick, and led a round of introductions.

## 2 Meeting Policy

### 2.1 Attendance and Membership

The chair explained that attendance is recorded electronically at [www.t11.org/att](http://www.t11.org/att), and explained the procedure. Attendance at this meeting does not count toward attendance at the plenaries of T11 and its task groups (i.e., being here will not get you out or keep you out of membership jeopardy).

The chair stated that all persons present are considered members of this meeting and may vote on questions, limited to one vote per company present. He advised that although T11 does not limit participation in the activities of its work groups to representatives of T11 member organizations, it requires nonmembers to identify themselves as such. Nonmembers that expect they may participate in the activities of T11 regularly were encouraged to become members.

No person identified himself as a member of an organization that is not a member of T11.

### 2.2 Patents

The chair indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the ANSI intellectual property policies as specified in pages 1-3 of [http://www.incits.org/pat\\_slides.pdf](http://www.incits.org/pat_slides.pdf). He displayed these pages without comment or explanation, and directed that questions about the policy should be referred to the questioner's legal counsel or the ANSI General Counsel.

### 2.3 Antitrust

The chair indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the INCITS Antitrust Guidelines. Any member of the meeting is responsible for objecting if he believes discussion in the

meeting violates those guidelines. As examples, there should never be discussion of the following topics at any INCITS or INCITS subgroup meeting:

- Any company's prices or pricing policies;
- Specific R&D, sales and marketing plans;
- Any company's confidential product, product development or production strategies;
- Whether certain suppliers or customers will be served;
- Prices paid to input sources; or
- Complaints about individual firms or other actions that might tend to hinder a competitor in any market.

If such discussion is not immediately terminated, it is the chairperson's responsibility to terminate the meeting. The INCITS Antitrust Guidelines are available at

<http://www.incits.org/inatrust.htm>

### 3 Administrivia

#### 3.1 Approval of Agenda

An agenda for the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 4 February 2009 has been posted as T11/09-036v0.

Roger Hathorn requested time to discuss a proposal on Virtual Links (T11/09-077v0).

***Landon Noll (Cisco) moved and Bill Martin (Emulex) seconded to accept T11/09-036v0 with the changes noted above as the agenda for this regular meeting. Approved unanimously.***

#### 3.2 Review of Minutes

Minutes for the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 10 December 2009 have been posted as T11/08-748v0.

Minutes for the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group interim meeting 20-21 January 2009 have been posted as T11/09-019v0.

***Bob Nixon (Emulex) moved and Horst Truustedt (TrueFocus) seconded to accept T11/08-748v0 as the minutes of the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group meeting on 10 December 2009 and to accept T11/09-019v0 as the minutes of the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group interim meeting 20-21 January 2009. Approved unanimously.***

### 4 Review of Old Action Items

- 080806-6 Roger Hathorn to define a mapping from Ethernet physical link statistics to at minimum some of the counters in the Link Status Block.  
(Close, a letter ballot comment has been opened on this issue)
- 081210-1 FC-BB-5 editor to incorporate T11/08-564v0 into FC-BB-5.  
(Completed by revision 1.04)

- 081210-2 Bob Nixon to publish a new document reflecting T11/08-676v0 amended as agreed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 10 December 2008.  
(Completed by posting of T11/08-676v1)
- 081210-3 FC-BB-5 editor to incorporate T11/08-676v0 amended as agreed at the FC-BB-5 ad hoc work group regular meeting 10 December 2008 into the FC-BB-5 letter ballot comment database.  
(Completed by revision 1.04)
- 081210-4 FC-BB-5 chair to schedule an all-day interim meeting in Salt Lake City, Denver, or San Jose the week of January 19, 2009.  
(Completed)
- 090121-1 Bob Nixon to recommend more accurate titles for what are now called the Virtual Link Instantiation and Virtual Link Maintenance subclauses.  
(Carry)

## **5 Old Business**

No old business was presented.

## **6 Scheduled Business**

### **6.1 MIB Concerns and Recommendations Update T11/09-068v0 Pelissier (Cisco)**

The MIB presentation and MIB document have been updated to incorporate changes agreed at their prior reviews. One noteworthy incomplete item is lack of input from HBA/CNA companies.

### **6.2 Virtual Links T11/09-077v0 Hathorn (IBM)**

The presentation introduced some changes to clarify certain ambiguously described critical elements of the FC-BB\_E architecture. The issues were accepted to be real, as the potential for confusion of even experienced standards members was evidenced by the presentation. Advice on the nature of the correct clarifications was developed in the meeting and captured by the chair. In summary, it was to:

- clarify that the identification of a Virtual Link that included a VN\_Port needed to include the VN\_Port ID; and
- add a defined term for the relation between an ENode FCoE Controller and an FCF FCoE Controller, and note that this is the logical mapping of a native FC link.

### **6.3 FC-BB-5: Letter Ballot Comments database T11/09-010v2 Peterson (Brocade)**

**ACTION David Black SHALL review Claudio's use of "shall", "should", and "may" when Claudio posts his rewrite of subclause 7.7.**

**ACTION David Black to bring in a proposal for reasonable checks FCFs shall make for MAC Address duplication.**

## 7 Unscheduled Business

## 8 Project Schedule

Milestone	Expected date
Last Technical Input	June 2008
T11 letter Ballot	October 2008
Forward to INCITS	TBD

## 9 Review of Action Items

- 090121-1 Bob Nixon to recommend more accurate titles for what are now called the Virtual Link Instantiation and Virtual Link Maintenance subclauses.  
(Carry)
- 090204-1 David Black SHALL review Claudio's use of "shall", "should", and "may" when Claudio posts his rewrite of subclause 7.7.
- 090204-2 David Black to bring in a proposal for reasonable checks FCFs shall make for MAC Address duplication.
- 090204-3 Chair to schedule a two-day interim meeting late February or early March, probably in Sunnyvale CA.

## 10 Meeting Schedule

### 10.1 Interim request

**ACTION** Chair to schedule a two-day interim meeting late February or early March, probably in Sunnyvale CA.

### 10.2 Next Plenary Week

Request 513 hours at the T11 plenary week hosted by Brocade in Memphis TN, 30 March - 3 April 2009.

## 11 Adjournment

*Bob Kembel (Solution Technology) moved and Silvano Gai (Cisco) seconded to adjourn. Approved unanimously.*

The regular meeting was adjourned at 4:30 PM CST on 4 February 2009.

## 12 Status of Open Proposals

Document Title	Number	Disposition	Author
Letter Ballot Comment database	T11/08-654	Close, replaced by T11/09-010.	Peterson (Brocade)
Letter Ballot Comment database	T11/09-010	Carry for continued comment resolution. Latest version presented was T11/09-010v2	Peterson (Brocade)
FIP Error Reporting	T11/08-717	Close, resolved instead by T11/08-578. Version presented was T11/08-717v0.	Peterson (Brocade)
FIP Errors	T11/08-578	Close, accepted as letter ballot comment resolution. Version presented was T11/08-578v1.	DeSanti (Cisco)
MIB Concern resolutions	T11/08-729	Close. Replaced by T11/09-068v0. Last version presented was T11/08-729v0.	Pelissier (Cisco), Peterson (Brocade)
MIB Concern resolutions	T11/09-068	Carry for HBA/CNA vendor input. Version presented was T11/09-077v0.	Pelissier (Cisco), Peterson (Brocade)
Virtual Links	T11/09-077	Close, resolutions to issues raised were captured in input to the next revision of FC-BB-5. Version presented was T11/09-077v0.	Hathorn (IBM)

### 13 Attendance

Organization	Representative
BLADE NETWORK TECHNOLOGIES	Chetan Yaliwal
BROADCOM	Pat Thaler
BROCADE	Anoop Ghanwani
BROCADE	Steven L. Wilson
CISCO	Joe Pelissier
CISCO SYSTEMS	Landon Noll
CISCO SYSTEMS	Silvano Gai
CISCO SYSTEMS, INC.	Claudio DeSanti
DELL	Gaurav Chawla
EMC	David Black
EMC	Erik Smith
EMC	Gary S. Robinson
EMULEX	Bob Nixon
EMULEX	William R. Martin
ENDL TEXAS	Ralph Weber
FINISAR CORPORATION	Jason Rusch
HEWLETT PACKARD	Jieming Zhu
HITACHI DATA SYSTEMS	Eric Hibbard
IBM	Louis Ricci
IBM	Roger Hathorn
IBM	Scott Carlson
LSI CORP.	John Lohmeyer
MELLANOX TECHNOLOGIES	Diego Crupnicoff
NETAPP	Frederick Knight
PANDUIT CORPORATION	Robert Elliot
PMC-SIERRA	Peichen Chang
QLOGIC CORP.	Craig W. Carlson
SOLUTION TECHNOLOGY	Robert Kembel
SUN MICROSYSTEMS	Michael Roy
SUN MICROSYSTEMS	Roger Dickerson
SYMANTEC	Roger Cummings
TRUE FOCUS, INC	Horst Truestedt