

Draft Minutes

T11.3 FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting

3 October 2005 - 2 PM to 6 PM

San Francisco CA

Revision 1: Corrected vote on forwarding FC-AL-2 Amendment 2.

The FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group of INCITS Technical Committee T11 Task Group T11.3 held a meeting at San Francisco CA on 3 October 2005, hosted by Solution Technology. Attendance was 17 people from 16 companies and is tabulated at the end of this document.

Minutes were taken by Bob Nixon (bob.nixon@emulex.com). Please report any corrections by email to the T11.3 reflector at T11_3@mail.T11.org.

1 Opening remarks and introductions

Chairperson Bill Martin opened the meeting Monday, 3 October 2005 at 2:02 PM. He thanked our host company, Solution Technology, and led a round of introductions.

1.1 Review of Minutes

Minutes for the FC-FS-2 meeting 8 August 2005 have been posted as T11/05-550v0.

It was noted that the August minutes were filed on the web site as though they were for June.

ACTION: FC-FS-2 secretary is to try to correct the filing of the August minutes

Minutes for the FC-AL-2 teleconference 30 August 2005 have been posted as T11/05-622v0.

It was moved by Bob Nixon and seconded by Bill Martin to accept T11/05-550v0 as the minutes of the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting on 8 August 2005 and T11/05-622v0 as the minutes of the FC-AL-2 ad hoc work group teleconference on 30 August 2005. Approved unanimously.

2 Approval of Agenda

T11/05-681v0

It was requested to do FC-AL-2 work before FC-FS-2 work in order to assure completion of processing of the FC-AL-2 amendment.

It was requested to consider Cisco comments 1 and 2 first among the FC-FS-2 work in order that the commenter could present his case and still attend the conflicting meeting of the FC-BaseT work group.

It was moved by Bill Martin and seconded by Horst Truededt to accept T11/05-681v0 with the changes noted above as the agenda for this meeting. Approved unanimously.

3 Review of Old Action Items

- AI 90 Bill Martin to publish T11/05-050v2 reflecting T11/05-050v1 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 8 August 2005.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-050v2)
- AI 91 FC-FS-2 editor to incorporate T11/05-050v1 with the changes agreed at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 8 August 2005 into FC-FS-2.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-190v3)
- AI 92 Bill Martin to review with Dave Peterson the changes to T11/05-443v1 agreed at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 8 August 2005.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED)
- AI 93 Dave Peterson to publish T11/05-443v2 reflecting T11/05-443v1 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 8 August 2005.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-443v2)
- AI 94 FC-FS-2 editor to incorporate T11/05-443v1 with the changes agreed at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 8 August 2005 into FC-FS-2.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-190v3)
- AI 95 Bill Martin to review with Dave Peterson the changes to T11/05-454v0 agreed at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 8 August 2005.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED)
- AI 96 Dave Peterson to publish T11/05-454v1 reflecting T11/05-454v0 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 8 August 2005.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-454v1)
- AI 97 FC-FS-2 editor to incorporate 11/05-454v0 with the changes agreed at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 8 August 2005 into FC-FS-2.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-190v3)
- AI 98 FC-FS-2 editor to incorporate T11/05-519v0 into FC-FS-2.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-190v3)
- AI 99 Bill Martin to prepare a project proposal for an FC-AL-2 amendment to include at least T11/ 04-762 and the text that results from T11/05-537.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-565v1)
- AI 100 Bob Dugan to determine what is the documentation for the algorithm that generates the values in the 8B10B table in FC-FS-2 and generate a letter ballot comment to add that informative reference to FC-FS-2.
(Opened 8 August 2005)
- AI 101 FC-FS-2 editor to publish FC-FS-2 version 0.90 (T11/05-190v3) reflecting FC-FS-2 version 0.80 (T11/05-190v2) and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 8 August 2005.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-190v3)

- AI 102 FC-FS-2 facilitator to recommend to T11.3 to forward FC-FS-2 version 0.90 (T11/05-190v3) to T11 for further processing.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED at T11.3 plenary meeting 11 August 2005)
- AI 103 Bill Martin to schedule a conference call to continue discussion of the Loop Latency proposal (T11/05-537) and announce its possible interest to T11.2 re FCBaseT.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED by teleconference 30 August 2005)
- AI 104 Dave Peterson to publish T11/05-214v3 reflecting T11/05-214v2 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 meeting 8 August 2005.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-214v3)
- AI 105 Dave Peterson to provide source for T11/05-214v3 to FC-FS-2 editor.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED)
- AI 106 FC-FS-2 editor to incorporate T11/05-214v3 into FC-FS-2.
(Opened 8 August 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-190v3)
- AI 107 Jim Coomes to publish T11/05-537v2 reflecting T11/05-537v1 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 30 August 2005.
(Opened 30 August 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-537v2)
- AI 108 Bill Martin to publish a document that combines T11/05-537v2 with approved document T11/04-762v2 as proposed text for FC-AL-2 amendment 2.
(Opened 30 August 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-644v0)
- AI 109 Bob Snively to publish a document detailing the resolution of ISO issues with normative references in FC-AL-2.
(Opened 30 August 2005) (CLOSED by 05-639v0)

4 Meeting Policies

4.1 Attendance and Membership

Bill Martin stated that all persons present are considered members of this meeting and may vote on questions, limited to one vote per company present. Attendance at this meeting does not count toward attendance at the plenaries of T11 and its task groups (i.e., being here will not get you out or keep you out of membership jeopardy).

4.2 Patents

Bill Martin indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the INCITS patent policies. He requested persons wishing to make statements or ask questions relevant to this policy not to do so at this work group meeting, but instead to do so at the T11.3 or T11 plenary meeting.

The INCITS patent policies are specified in subclause 8.4 of RD-1, "Policies and Guidelines", available at

http://www.incits.org/sd9_rev1c.htm#p8-4

4.3 Antitrust

Bill Martin indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the INCITS Antitrust Guidelines. Any member of the meeting is responsible for objecting if he believes discussion in the meeting violates those guidelines. If such discussion is not immediately terminated, it is the chairperson's responsibility to terminate the meeting.

The INCITS Antitrust Guidelines are available at

<http://www.incits.org/inatrust.htm>

5 Old Business

6 Scheduled FC-AL-2 Business

6.1 Proposed response to ISO editor concerning FC-AL-2 05-638v0), 05-639v0 Snively/Brocade

The presentations reported several problems that the ISO editor identified in the draft of FC-AL-2 that he was reviewing (see 05-638v0). The presentations continued by proposing resolutions that may be incorporated as editorial changes in the final ISO standard.

It was agreed that the alternative of using ANSI/INCITS references for ISO obsolete works should be removed from the proposal.

It was moved by Bill Martin and seconded by Ralph Weber to instruct Bob Snively to modify his proposal to propose only the second of the alternatives the current version proposes. Approved unanimously.

ACTION: Bob Snively to publish T11/05-639v1 reflecting T11/05-639v0 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 3 October 2005.

There was concern that the proposed changes have not been carefully reviewed other than by the proposer. There was further concern that the document prepared via the ISO editing process has not been carefully compared with the original T11 document to assure that no substantive changes were made. Consideration of these concerns will be taken up in an interim conference call.

6.2 FC-AL-2 Amendment

05-644v1

Martin/Sierra Logic

It was agreed to update the email address of the T11 vice chair.

It was moved by Bill Martin and seconded by Horst Truedtedt to recommend to T11.3 to forward T11/05-644v2, reflecting T11/05-644v1 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 3 October 2005, to T11 for further processing as amendment 2 to FC-AL-2. The motion passed 13 Favoring, none Opposing, 3 Abstaining.

ACTION: Horst Truedtedt to publish T11/05-644v2, reflecting T11/05-644v1 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 3 October 2005.

ACTION: FC-FS-2 facilitator to recommend to T11.3 to forward T11/05-644v2, reflecting T11/05-644v1 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 3 October 2005, to T11 for further processing as amendment 2 to FC-AL-2.

7 New Business

7.1 FC-FS-2 Letter Ballot Comments

05-660v0

Martin/Sierra Logic

7.1.1 Cisco-001

Open.

ACTION: Claudio DeSanti to post the presentations he made to the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group on 3 October 2005 on the topic of frame fill bytes within an encrypted payload (Cisco-001).

7.1.2 Cisco-002

Reject. After the first sentence of 9.8, add "independent of X_ID". After table 77 description of the OX_ID field, add a note that although the SSB contains X_IDs, SEQ_IDs are unique without requiring qualification by an X_ID.

7.1.3 Emulex-2

Accept.

7.1.4 Agilent-2

Accept. The sentences will be reversed. A minor clarification will be made: service becomes class of service.

7.1.5 Emulex-3

Accept.

7.1.6 Emulex-4

Open.

ACTION: Bob Nixon to propose clarifications to the description of segmentation and reassembly (Emulex-4).

7.1.7 Sierra_Logic-13

Open pending Emulex-4

7.1.8 Agilent-8

Open pending Emulex-4

7.1.9 Sierra_Logic-16

Accept.

7.1.10 Sierra_Logic-19

Accept. Reference FC-PI for Bit Synchronization.

7.1.11 Sierra_Logic-24

Reject. The name is of the state, not the event. In 6.1 and figure 9, remove the shorthand state tags and use only the long form state names.

7.1.12 Sierra_Logic-28

Accept

7.1.13 Sierra_Logic-29

Accept

7.1.14 Sierra_Logic-31

Accept

7.1.15 Sierra_Logic-32

Accept

7.1.16 Sierra_Logic-34

Accept

7.1.17 Sierra_Logic-35

Accept

7.1.18 Sierra_Logic-37

Open.

ACTION: Bob Nixon to report on the history and relevance of transmitter state machine to FC-FS-2.

7.1.19 Sierra_Logic-38

Open. see Sierra_Logic-37

7.1.20 Sierra_logic-40

Accept

7.1.21 Sierra_Logic-42

Accept.

7.1.22 Sierra_Logic-43

Open pending resolution of retention of Class 4.

7.1.23 Sierra_Logic-44

Accept.

7.1.24 Emulex-5

Accept.

7.1.25 SPC-07

Accept.

7.1.26 Cisco-08

Accept. See SPC-07.

7.1.27 Emulex-6

Accept.

7.1.28 Emulex-7

Accept.

7.1.29 Sierra_Logic-63

Accept. The word "consecutive" was replaced where it was applied to SEQ_NR values.

7.1.30 Sierra_Logic-64

Accept. The word "consecutive" was replaced where it was applied to SEQ_NR values.

7.1.31 Sierra_Logic-66

Accept.

7.1.32 Cisco-006

Accept.

7.1.33 Sierra_Logic-76

Accept. Rewording was agreed.

7.1.34 Emulex-8

Accept.

7.1.35 Sierra_Logic-78

Open. Expecting input from DeSanti.

7.1.36 Sierra_Logic-78

Open. Expecting input from DeSanti.

7.1.37 Emulex-9

Accept.

8 Project Schedule

Milestone	Expected date
Final new technical input	Completed April 2005
Letter Ballot	Completed September 2005
INCITS First PR	Not yet determined

9 Meeting Schedule

Request 4 hours at the T11 plenary week hosted by Northrop Grumman in Garden Grove, CA, 5-8 December 2005.

10 Review of Action Items

- AI 100 Bob Dugan to determine what is the documentation for the algorithm that generates the values in the 8B10B table in FC-FS-2 and generate a letter ballot comment to add that informative reference to FC-FS-2.
(Opened 8 August 2005)
- AI 110 Bob Snively to publish T11/05-639v1 reflecting T11/05-639v0 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 3 October 2005.
(Opened 3 October 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-639v1)
- AI 111 Horst Truedstedt to publish T11/05-644v2, reflecting T11/05-644v1 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 3 October 2005.
(Opened 3 October 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-644v2)
- AI 112 FC-FS-2 facilitator to recommend to T11.3 to forward T11/05-644v2, reflecting T11/05-644v1 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group meeting 3 October 2005, to T11 for further processing as amendment 2 to FC-AL-2.
(Opened 3 October 2005)
- AI 113 Claudio DeSanti to post the presentations he made to the FC-FS-2 ad hoc work group on 3 October 2005 on the topic of frame fill bytes within an encrypted payload (Cisco-001).
(Opened 3 October 2005) (CLOSED by T11/05-708v0)
- AI 114 Bob Nixon to propose clarifications to the description of segmentation and reassembly (Emulex-4).
(Opened 3 October 2005)
- AI 115 Bob Nixon to report on the history and relevance of transmitter state machine to FC-FS-2 (Sierra_Logic-37).
(Opened 3 October 2005)

AI 116 FC-FS-2 secretary is to try to correct the filing of the August minutes.
(Opened 3 October 2005) (CLOSED, done on October 4, 2005)

11 Adjournment

It was moved by Bill Martin and seconded by Jim Coomes to adjourn. Approved unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:53 PM on 3 October 2005.

12 Status of Open Proposals

Document Title	Number	Disposition
FC-AL Fairness Problem	T11/04-762	Close, incorporated in T11/05-644. Approved version is T11/04-762v3
Increase Loop Latency spec	T11/05-537	Close, incorporated in T11/05-644. Approved version is T11/05-537v2.
FC-AL-2 amendment 2	T11/05-644	Close, recommended forwarding to INCITS of T11/05-644v2

13 Attendance

Organization	Representative
AGILENT	Roy Elsbernd
BROCADE COMMUNICATIONS	Robert Snively
CISCO SYSTEMS, INC.	Claudio DeSanti
EMULEX	Bob Nixon
ENDL TEXAS	Ralph Weber
IBM POUGHKEEPSIE	Robert Dugan
LSI LOGIC	John Lohmeyer
LSI LOGIC, INC.	David Weber
PACKETLIGHT	Eyal Gabay
SEAGATE TECHNOLOGY	James Coomes
SIERRA LOGIC	William R. Martin
STORAGE PROTOCOL CONSULTING	Neil Wanamaker
SUN MICROSYSTEMS	Matt Gaffney
TRUE FOCUS, INC	Horst Truestedt
UNISYS CORPORATION	Wayne Gentry
XIOTECH	Jeffrey Williams
XYRATEX	Rich Ramos