

Draft Minutes

T11.3 FC-FS-2 Ad Hoc Work Group

31 January 2005 - 10 AM to noon

Dana Point CA

The FC-FS-2 Ad Hoc Work Group of INCITS Technical Committee T11 Task Group T11.3 met at Dana Point CA on 31 January 2005, hosted by QLogic. Attendance was 27 people from 21 companies and is tabulated at the end of this document.

Minutes were taken by Bob Nixon (bob.nixon@emulex.com). Please report any corrections by email to the T11.3 reflector at T11_3@mail.T11.org.

1 Opening remarks and introductions

Chairperson Bill Martin opened the meeting Monday, 31 January 2005 at 10:10 AM. He thanked our host company, QLogic, and led a round of introductions.

1.1 Review of Minutes

05-074v0

It was moved by Bob Nixon and seconded by Bill Martin to accept 05-074v0 with the changes noted above as the minutes of the FC-FS-2 ad hoc meeting on 6 December 2004. Approved unanimously.

2 Approval of Agenda

05-051v1

It was requested to add a topic for project schedule.

It was moved by Bill Martin and seconded by Horst Truedstedt to accept 05-051v1 with the change noted above as the agenda for this meeting. Approved unanimously.

3 Review of Old Action Items

- AI 36 FC-FS-2 editor to fix figures in FC-FS-2 as directed by 04-312v0.
(Opened 7 June 2004) (Carryover)
- AI 56 Harry Paul will research whether FC-FS-2 as modified by 04-602v2 allows alternate credit management.
(Opened 6 December 2004) (Carryover)
- AI 57 Bob Nixon to publish 04-602v2 reflecting 04-602v1 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 meeting 6 December 2004.
(Opened 6 December 2004) (CLOSED by 04-602v2)
- AI 58 FC-FS-2 editor to incorporate 04-602v2 into FC-FS-2.
(Opened 6 December 2004) (CLOSED by 04-045v5)
- AI 59 FC-FS-2 editor to incorporate 04-629v2 into FC-FS-2.
(Opened 6 December 2004) (CLOSED by 04-045v5)

- AI 60 FC-FS-2 editor to incorporate 04-751v0 into FC-FS-2.
(Opened 6 December 2004) (CLOSED by 04-045v5)
- AI 61 Claudio DeSanti to publish 04-775v1 reflecting 04-775v0 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 meeting
6 December 2004.
(Opened 6 December 2004) (CLOSED by 04-775v1)
- AI 62 FC-FS-2 editor to incorporate 04-775v1 into FC-FS-2.
(Opened 6 December 2004) (CLOSED by 04-045v5)
- AI 63 FC-FS-2 editor to incorporate 04-776v0 into FC-FS-2.
(Opened 6 December 2004) (CLOSED by 04-045v5)
- AI 64 Bob Nixon to post the ISO editor's requests for changes to FC-FS.
(Opened 6 December 2004) (CLOSED by 04-821v0)
- AI 65 FC-FS-2 facilitator to recommend to T11.3 to approve the ISO editor's requests for changes to FC-FS.
(Opened 6 December 2004) (CLOSED at T11 plenary 9 December 2004)
- AI 66 FC-FS-2 editor to incorporate 04-821v0 into FC-FS-2.
(Opened 6 December 2004) (CLOSED by 04-045v5)

4 Meeting Policies

4.1 Attendance and Membership

Bill Martin stated that all persons present are considered members of this meeting and may vote on questions, limited to one vote per company present. Attendance at this meeting does not count toward attendance at the plenaries of T11 and its task groups (i.e., being here will not get you out or keep you out of membership jeopardy).

4.2 Patents

Bill Martin indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates is the ANSI patent policy. He directed persons wishing to make statements or ask questions relevant to this policy to do so at the T11.3 or T11 plenary meeting.

4.3 Antitrust

Bill Martin indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates is the INCITS Antitrust Guidelines. Any member of the meeting is responsible for objecting if he believes discussion in the meeting violates those guidelines.

5 Old Business

5.1 FC-FS-2 Version 0.50

04-045v5

Nixon/Emulex

All approved documents have been incorporated. Bob invited all to review the "editorial discretion" changes.

5.2 Editor's Issues with Version 0.50

05-014v0

Nixon/Emulex

Agreed to remove the changes of all uses of “fabric” to “Fabric”.

ACTION: Bob Nixon to propose resolution of use of the term “fabric” where the intention is “Fabric” or “topology”.

Agreed that the header “Protocol” should be “Protocols”.

Agreed to remove the reorganization of the references, but keep the new contact information subclause.

ACTION: Ralph Weber to propose a convention for organizing reference citations in T11 stuff, specifically to note the distinctions of ISO, ISO national body, and other sources.

It was moved by Bob Nixon and seconded by Claudio DeSanti to incorporate 05-014v1 into FC-FS-2, reflecting 05-014v0 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 meeting 31 January 2005. Approved unanimously.

ACTION: Bob Nixon to publish 05-014v1 reflecting 05-014v0 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 meeting 31 January 2005.

ACTION: FC-FS-2 editor to incorporate 05-014v1 into FC-FS-2.

5.3 FC-AL Fairness Problem

04-762v2

Trustedt/TrueFocus

The proposal has been modified to reflect the change agreed at the last meeting. This treats a received ARBff the same as IDLE for purpose of resetting the fairness window and causes the fill word to change to ARBff.

It was observed this could make some current products noncompliant, though under very unusual circumstances.

Agreed that language will be added to allow legacy behavior that does not treat ARBff as IDLE and does not change its fill word to ARBff.

Further discussion was postponed to the next meeting, pending related work for 8GFC EMI control (see 6.1).

6 New Business

6.1 ARBff for 8Gb links

05-050v0

Martin/Sierra Logic

The Physical Task Group has requested a change to eliminate most occurrences of IDLE for 8GFC, and suggested changing them to ARBff.

This proposal was presented for initial discussion in FC-FS. Several suggestions were made to the presenter. He will bring the revised proposal back next time.

6.2 Fabric Naming

05-019v0, 05-020v0

Snively/Brocade

This proposal poses an issue of scoping for Name_Identifiers that may arise when fabrics are merged, or when multiple fabrics are managed by a common entity. Name_Identifiers that are not Worldwide_Names are not necessarily unique in these expanded scopes. The proposed resolution was to define a term for these larger scopes, and require Name_Identifier uniqueness in this larger scope.

Discussion time was limited, and further discussion is expected at other work groups and at the next meeting of this work group.

6.3 Security for Basic Link Services

05-064v0

DeSanti/Cisco

This proposal incorporates changes requested when an earlier version was presented at the last meeting.

It was moved by Claudio DeSanti and seconded by Bill Martin to incorporate 05-064v0 into FC-FS-2, Approved unanimously.

ACTION: FC-FS-2 editor to incorporate 05-064v0 into FC-FS-2, and add a reference from the definition of FT-0 to figure 16 and a correction to the title of the blue block in figure 17.

An issue was raised of confusion between use of “data field” and “payload”. Some felt there was no issue.

It was agreed to clarify the use of “payload” in the revised definition of FT-0 by a reference to figure 16. The action to the editor concerning 05-064v0 was extended to include this clarification.

It was agreed that in figure 17, the title of the Encrypted Payload (...) block should be Encrypted Optional Headers and Payload. The action to the editor concerning 05-064v0 was extended to include this correction.

7 Project Schedule

This discussion was deferred to FC-LS. It is intended the FC-FS-2 and FC-LS schedules will be the same.

8 Review of Action Items

- AI 36 FC-FS-2 editor to fix figures in FC-FS-2 as directed by 04-312v0.
(Opened 7 June 2004) (Carryover)
- AI 56 Harry Paul will research whether FC-FS-2 as modified by 04-602v2 allows alternate credit management.
(Opened 6 December 2004) (Carryover)
- AI 67 Bob Nixon to propose resolution of use of the term “fabric” where the intention is “Fabric” or “topology”.
(Opened 31 January 2005)
- AI 68 Ralph Weber to propose a convention for organizing reference citations in T11 stuff, specifically to note the distinctions of ISO, ISO national body, and other sources.
(Opened 31 January 2005)
- AI 69 Bob Nixon to publish 05-014v1 reflecting 05-014v0 and the agreements at the FC-FS-2 meeting 31 January 2005.
(Opened 31 January 2005) (CLOSED by 05-014v1)
- AI 70 FC-FS-2 editor to incorporate 05-014v1 into FC-FS-2.
(Opened 31 January 2005)
- AI 71 FC-FS-2 editor to incorporate 05-064v0 into FC-FS-2, and add a reference from the definition of FT-0 to figure 16 and a correction to the title of the blue block in figure 17
(Opened 31 January 2005)
- AI 72 Next AI

9 Meeting Schedule

Request 3 hours at the T11 Plenary Week beginning 4 April 2005 in La Jolla CA.

10 Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 12:18 AM on 31 January 2005.

11 Actions on Proposals at This Meeting

Document Title	Number	Disposition
FC-AL Fairness Problem	04-762	Carry for further revision. Latest version is 04-762v2.
Security Protection for Basic Link Services	04-777	Close. Replaced by 05-064.
Security Protection for Basic Link Services	05-064	Close. Approved 05-064v0.
Transmit adaptive equalization	04-805	Carry pending technical specification.
Editor's Issues with Version 0.50	05-014	Close. Approved 05-014v1.
Fabric Naming text	05-019	Carry for further revision. Latest version is 05-019v0
Fabric Naming presentation	05-020	Carry for further revision. Latest version is 05-020v0
ARBff for 8Gb links	05-050	Carry for further revision. Latest version is 05-050v0.

12 Attendance

Name	Organization Represented
Roy Elsbernd	AGILENT
Robert Snively	BROCADE COMMUNICATIONS
Steven L. Wilson	BROCADE COMMUNICATIONS
Sashi Thiagarajan	CIENA CORPORATION
Claudio DeSanti	CISCO SYSTEMS, INC.
Harry V. Paul	CNT CORPORATION
Bob Nixon	EMULEX
Ken Hirata	EMULEX
Ralph Weber	ENDL TEXAS
Frank Barber	ESILICON CORPORATION
Neil Wanamaker	FINISAR CORP.
Vinod Bhat	HEWLETT PACKARD
Dan Colegrove	HITACHI GLOBAL STORAGE TECHNOLOGIES
Scott Carlson	IBM
Joe Pelissier	MCDATA
Scott Kipp	MCDATA
Dave Slater	Northrop Grumman
James Nelson	NORTHROP GRUMMAN
Ed McGlaughlin	QLOGIC
Craig Carlson	QLOGIC CORP.
William R. Martin	SIERRA LOGIC
Steve Sletten	SUN MICROSYSTEMS
Vit Novak	SUN MICROSYSTEMS
Horst Truedtedt	TRUE FOCUS, INC
Jun Ma	WAVECREST
Jeff Williams	XIOTECH
Rich Ramos	XYRATEX