

Draft Minutes

T11.3 FC-FS Ad Hoc Meeting

10 December 2002 - 1 PM to 6 PM

Tucson Arizona

An ad hoc meeting of work group FC-FS of INCITS Technical Committee T11 Task Group T11.3 was held at Tucson Arizona on 10 December 2002. Attendance at this meeting was 35 people from 28 companies and is tabulated at the end of this document.

Minutes were taken by Bob Nixon (bob.nixon@emulex.com)

Unless otherwise noted, all references to FC-FS are to revision 1.70.

1 Opening remarks and introductions

John Scheible

Facilitator John Scheible opened the meeting Tuesday, 10 December 2002 at 1:03 PM. He thanked our host company, FSI Consulting Services, and led a round of introductions. He announced that all patent issues are to be brought to plenary meetings.

2 Approval of Agenda

02-715v1

John Scheible

Approved with a few corrections to the reference documents for actions/presentations.

3 Approval of Minutes

3.1 FS report to T11.3 – 10/10/02

02-620v0

John Scheible

Accepted as written

3.2 FC-FS meeting 8 October 2002

02-628v1

Bob Nixon

Accepted as written

3.3 FC-FS meeting 5 and 7 November 2002

02-670v0

Bob Nixon

Accepted as written

4 Carryover Action Items (not presented)

- 4.1 Craig Carlson to prepare a proposal for text concerning QLogic-044 to be inserted in the relevant tables.
(Opened 7/16/02) (CLOSED by 02-713v0)
- 4.2 Dave Peterson to provide resolution for QLogic-012 (need to post 02-557v1)
(Opened 8/6/02) (CLOSED)
- 4.3 Craig Carlson to review the list of ELSs in QLogic-038.

- (Opened 8/6/02) (CLOSED by meeting discussion 10 December 2002)
- 4.4 Craig Carlson to request feedback from SW group on meaning of "first" in Andiamo-057 (opened 9/10/02) (CLOSED)
- 4.5 Bill Martin to bring FC-FS comment QLogic-051 to the attention of the FC-MI-2 work group. (opened 10/8/02) (CARRYOVER)
- 4.6 Craig Carlson to publish detailed text to implement the alternatives from 02-662v0 agreed at the FC-FS meeting 5 November 2002. (opened 11/5/02) (CLOSED by 02-719v0)
- 4.7 John Scheible to publish 02-569v3 from 02-569v2 and the agreements at the FC-FS meeting on 5 November 2002 (opened 11/5/02) (CLOSED by 02-569v3)
- 4.8 Bill Martin to publish the revised resolution for FSI-011 he presented at the FC-FS meeting 5 November 2002. (opened 11/5/02) (CLOSED by 02-681v0)
- 4.9 Bob Nixon to propose a definition of "discard" on the T11.3 reflector and request discussion. (opened 11/7/02) (CLOSED by 02-720v0)
- 4.10 Claudio DeSanti to publish the wording for Broadcast agreed at the FC-FS meeting November 7, 2002. (opened 11/7/02) (CLOSED by 02-672v0)
- 4.11 Bob Nixon to send a message on the T11.3 reflector advising of the intent to discard the subclause discussing moviecast. (opened 11/7/02) (CLOSED by email 12 November 02)
- 4.12 John Scheible to send resolution for Tivoli-106 to Mike Foster for verification. (opened 11/7/02) (CLOSED by email 13 November 02)
- 4.13 Neil Wanamaker to identify more specifically what is at issue in Akara-012 (opened 11/7/02) (DROPPED)
- 4.14 Bill Martin to write text for 15.2.7 defining re-login and for 15.4.3 to remove the implicit logout for NOS/ OLS in the case of re-login. (opened 11/7/02) (CLOSED by meeting discussion 10 December 2002)
- 4.15 John Scheible to include discussion of 02-527v0 in next meeting agenda. (opened 11/7/02) (CLOSED by 02-715v0)

5 Scheduled FS Business (problem resolution)

John Scheible

5.1 P1- FSI-016 – Class 6 exclusion

02-619v0

Gary Stephens

This document was deferred from the last meeting so the author could be present. He still was unable to be present (obligations of being meeting host...)

Agreed to delete the class-1-specific sentence at issue, since the necessary text is at the end of the second paragraph of 17.1.5.

Agreed to delete the "Sequence...ULP" partial sentence since it is not relevant to defining exchanges.

It was moved by John Scheible and seconded by Claudio DeSanti to accept 02-619v0 with the changes agreed at the FC-FS meeting 10 December 2002 as resolving FSI-016. Accepted without objection.

5.2 P2- FSI-057 – F class

02-719v0

Craig Carlson

Agreed that in the revised subclause 8.3.6 “non-switch internal ports” will be changed to “a port that is not internal to the Fabric (i.e., an Nx_Port or Fx_Port)”.

It was moved by Craig Carlson and seconded by Bob Nixon to accept 02-719v0 with the change agreed at the FC-FS meeting 10 December 2002 as resolving FSI-057 and QLogic-027. Accepted without objection.

It was noted later that it also solves QLogic-061.

5.3 P3- QLogic-027 – F class 02-719v0 Craig Carlson

See the resolution of 5.2

5.4 P4- Pirus-016 – Pre-emp clarification 02-527v0 Mike Foster

Mike was not present. His document was reviewed by the group.

Agreed that in the first line of the second paragraph of the proposed new 9.5.3.3 remove “interpreted to be”.

It was moved by John Scheible and seconded by Bob Nixon to accept 02-527v0 with the change agreed at the FC-FS meeting 10 December 2002 as resolving Pirus-016. Accepted without objection.

5.5 P5-AI-01 - QLogic-044 02-713v0 Craig Carlson

Agreed to change “and” in the added text to “an”.

It was moved by Craig Carlson and seconded by Charles Monia to accept 02-713v0 with the change agreed at the FC-FS meeting 10 December 2002 as resolving QLogic-044. Accepted without objection.

5.6 P6-Andiamo-089 nodoc Bill Martin

Bill presented text changes prepared during the meeting. With some changes resulting from group review, they were approved.

ACTION: Bill Martin to publish the resolution to Andiamo-089 as presented at the FC-FS meeting 10 December 2002.

It was moved by Bill Martin and seconded by John Scheible to accept the resolution discussed as resolving Andiamo-089. Accepted without objection

5.7 P7-QLogic-061 02-719v0 Craig Carlson

See the resolution of 5.2

5.8 Status 02-161vA

As of 11/8 - Technical 98/02/00% (07 unres) Editorial(100/00/00%) (00 unres)

As of 12/10, end of meeting - Technical 100/00/00% (00 unres) Editorial(100/00/00%) (00 unres)

6 Scheduled FS Business (action items)

6.1 Provide resolution QLogic-044 **02-713v0** **Craig Carlson**

See the resolution of 5.5

6.2 Provide resolution QLogic-012 **02-557v0** **Dave Peterson**

The document was uploaded, but got trapped in "Incoming". The approved document, 02-557v1, is available. See 7.4.

6.3 QLogic-038 correction disc **Craig Carlson**

Agreed that resolving QLogic-038 requires both the ELS list as in the suggested solution for the comment, except FAN, and changing the table header to "PLOGI" as in the agreed resolution to the comment.

6.4 Meaning of "first" in Andiamo-057 **nodoc** **Craig Carlson**

Agreed in the second paragraph of 15.2.2.2 to replace "In its first attempt at explicit fabric login" with "If the Nx_Port is unidentified".

When this was viewed in context, a discussion ensued about how a fabric is expected to respond if presented with an FLOGI with an identification (i.e., nonzero S_ID) that the fabric was unwilling to assign. Two disagreements: what kind of response (LS_ACC, F_RJT, or LS_RJT) and what D_ID in the reply (requested or reassigned). There is no answer in FS that stands without a lot of guesswork. PHX seemed a little more explicit, but the group still disagreed. PH suggests the possibility that an Nx_Port may try both an identification (i.e., a nonzero S_ID) and a zero S_ID before being required to try a different identification.

Agreed that if a fabric is unwilling to assign the S_ID that appears in an FLOGI, or if the S_ID in a FLOGI is zero and the fabric is unwilling to assign an S_ID, the fabric shall reply with an F_RJT for invalid S_ID

Agreed that an Nx_Port should try both a zero S_ID and an identification (nonzero S_ID) in either order before trying a different identification.

These agreements are to be incorporated in 15.2.2.3 list item e sublist item B by changing the option allowed there to "...may select a value hex'00 00 00' or hex'00 00 YY' or a new hex'XX XX XX' and originate..."

6.5 Bring QLogic-051 to MI-2 **Bill Martin**

This action is carried over.

6.6 Document alt to 02-662v0 **02-719v0** **Craig Carlson**

See the resolution of 5.2

6.7 Revised resolution to FSI-011 **02-681v0** **Bill Martin**

In email dated 15 November 2002, Michael Foster noted that the resolution to FSI-011 approved in 02-681v0 did not reflect the resolution agreed for Boeing-002. This was explained by the operating rule that all resolutions must be stated with respect to FC-FS revision 1.70. The integration of multiple changes to the same text is the responsibility of the editors of the next revision.

6.8 Definition of Discard **02-720v0** **Bob Nixon**

Bob's proposed definition of discard was discarded. The main issue was much narrower than his proposal had taken on, and an appropriately specific resolution was worked out in discussion:

Agreed that in FC-FS, move 8.9.2 item c to replace 18.5.2 item e, remove SOFx4 from the new item e, and append "regardless of whether the frame is valid, invalid, or discarded." Duplicate the list of SOFs from the new item e to replace similar but less specific lists in items d and b.

These changes will be associated with comment QLogic-061.

6.9 Published revised Broadcast **02-672v0** **Claudio DeSanti**

An email discussion had begun by questioning this resolution, but concluded in accepting it. No further action was seen necessary.

6.10 Define issue with Akara-012 **Neil Wanamaker**

Lacking the presenter, the current resolution (see 02-161vA) was not altered.

6.11 Relogin remove logout **Bill Martin**

See the resolution of 5.6

7 Unscheduled New Business

7.1 Late comment – SB-3 LB comment **02-689v0** **Giles Frazier**

Bob Dugan presented in behalf of Giles.

There is a rule in FS 17.1.5 against sending other classes of service in the same exchange with class 3 sequences. SB-2 and SB-3 have discovered they violate the rule. The motivation for the violation is to have long-lived exchanges that carry both high-reliability ULP operations and recoverable ULP operations.

Agreed that the rule may be qualified to become "Unless stated otherwise by the upper level, Class 3 sequences shall not be sent in the same exchange with sequences in any other class of service".

It was moved by John Scheible and seconded by Bill Martin to accept the resolution as discussed, pending acceptance of the late comment by T11.3. Accepted, 11Y, 4N.

7.2 Late comment – BER threshold **02-708v0** **Scott Kipp**

Scott requested that resolution of this comment be deferred into FS-2.

7.3 Reopen Buffer Limitation RPBC **02-191v5** **Scheible/DeSanti**

This proposal elaborates on the resolution to IBM-027 and IBM-028 by communicating ELS buffer limitation information from the requester to the responder. The original resolution only returned the information from the responder to the requester.

It was moved by John Scheible and seconded by Horst Truededt to accept 02-195v5 as a revised resolution to IBM-027 and IBM-028. Accepted without objection.

7.4 Revised resolution to QLogic-012

02-557v1

Dave Peterson

Dave presented a few changes to the previously accepted proposal.

Agreed to use 02-557v1 with the change in the glossary to make Information Units owned by "upper level" not "FC-4".

7.5 Any further issues with the resolutions today?

Charles Monia expressed dissatisfaction with the resolution of 7.1, which he felt needed a precautionary notice to those who might inappropriately exercise the new freedom.

ACTION: John Scheible to prepare a new revision of 02-161 based on 02-161vA and the resolutions agreed at the FC-FS meeting 10 December 2002.

It was moved by John Scheible and seconded by Charles Monia to accept 02-161vA as a revised resolution to all FC-FS letter ballot comments. Accepted 15Y ON 1A.

John stated he had volunteer co-editors. There did not seem to be likelihood of having enough done to have an editors' meeting at the January T10 Plenary. An editors' meeting seemed necessary, though. Expect an editors' meeting in February and forwarding in April, but if everything comes together quickly, forwarding would be possible in February.

Craig Carlson volunteered to prepare a project proposal for a followon to the ELS specifications in FC-FS and John Scheible will prepare one for followon to FC-FS less ELSs.

8 Review Action Items

- 8.1 Bill Martin to bring FC-FS comment QLogic-051 to the attention of the FC-MI-2 work group.
(opened 10/8/02) (CARRYOVER)
- 8.2 Bill Martin to publish the resolution to Andiamo-089 as presented at the FC-FS meeting 10 December 2002.
(opened 12/10/02)
- 8.3 John Scheible to prepare a new revision of 02-161 based on 02-161vA and the resolutions agreed at the FC-FS meeting 10 December 2002..
(opened 12/10/02) (CLOSED by 02-161vC)

9 Future meetings

No meeting in January T10 plenary week.

Request 3 hours at February T11 plenary week for an editors' meeting.

Undecided for March T10 plenary week.

10 Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 5:50 PM 10 December 2002.

11 Documents Approved

02-619v0 with the changes agreed at the FC-FS meeting 10 December 2002 to resolve FSI-016

02-719v0 with the change agreed at the FC-FS meeting 10 December 2002 to resolve FSI-057, QLogic-027, and QLogic-061

02-527v0 with the change agreed at the FC-FS meeting 10 December 2002 to resolve Pirus-016

02-713v0 with the change agreed at the FC-FS meeting 10 December 2002 to resolve QLogic-044

Bill Martin document to be published as resolving Andiamo-089

02-195v5 as a revised resolution to IBM-027 and IBM-028

02-557v1 as a revised resolution to QLogic-012

12 Open Issues

None

13 Attendance

Company Represented	Last Name	First Name	Email
Adaptec	Roberts	Ron	ron_roberts@adaptec.com
Andiamo Systems	DeSanti	Claudio	cds@andiamo.com
Brocade	Martin	William R.	bmartin@brocade.com
Cisco Systems	Peterson	David	dap@cisco.com
Computer Bus Tools	Tilman	Bill	bill@bustools.com
Connectivity Solutions	Kembel	Robert W.	kembel@compuserve.com
Crossroads	Tyndall	John	jtyndall@crossroads.com
Data Device Corp	Gelish	Joseph	gelish@ddc-web.com
Emulex	Nixon	Bob	bob.nixon@emulex.com
ENDL Texas	Weber	Ralph	roweber@acm.org
Exabyte	Rose	Roger	rogerr@exabyte.com
Extreme Networks	Warren	Jeff	jwarren@extremenetworks.com
FSI	Stephens	Gary	grsfsi@aol.com
IBM	Dickens	Louie	dickens@us.ibm.com
IBM	Dugan	Robert	dugan@us.ibm.com
IBM	Lancaster	Peter	lancastp@us.ibm.com

Company Represented	Last Name	First Name	Email
IBM	Owen	Bill	billowen@us.ibm.com
IBM	Scheible	John	jpscheible@aol.com
IBM - Tivoli	Penokie	George	gop@us.ibm.com
Inrange	Paul	Harry	harry.paul@inrange.com
LSI Logic	Lohmeyer	John	lohmeier@t10.org
McData	Hofer	Larry	larry.hofer@mcdata.com
McData	Kipp	Scott	scott.kipp@mcdata.com
McData	O'Donnell	Mike	mike.o'donnell@mcdata.com
Nishan	Monia	Charles	cmonia@nishansystems.com
PMC-Sierra	Leavey	Gerry	gerry_leavey@pmc-sierra.com
QLogic	Carlson	Craig	craig.carlson@QLogic.com
Sandial	Sheehan	Tim	tsheehan@sandial.com
Sanera Systems	Pelissier	Joseph	joep@sanera.net
Seagate	Coomes	James	jim_coomes@seagate.com
StorageTek	Gaffney	Matt	matt_gaffney@stortek.com
Sun Microsystems	Sletten	Steven	steven.sletten@sun.com
True Focus	Truestedt	Horst	hotrues@attglobal.net
Velio	Aytac	Haluk	haluk@velio.com
Vixel	Hirata	Ken	khirata@vixel.com