

Draft Minutes

T11.3 FC-FS Working Group Meeting

July 16, 2002 – Colorado Springs, CO

9 AM – 6 PM

A meeting of working group FC-FS of INCITS Technical Committee T11 Task Group T11.3 was held at Colorado Springs, Colorado on July 16, 2002, in conjunction with the T10 Plenary Week meetings. Attendance at this meeting was 6 people from 6 companies and is tabulated at the end of this document.

Minutes were taken by Bob Nixon (bob.nixon@emulex.com)

1. Opening remarks and introductions: John Scheible

Facilitator John Scheible opened the meeting at 9:06 AM Tuesday, July 16, 2002. He thanked our host company, LSI Logic, and led a round of introductions.

John then indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the T11, INCITS, and ANSI patent policies. He directed persons wishing to make statements relevant to those policies to do so at the T11.3 or T11 plenary meeting.

2. Call for changes to minutes

2.1 AL-2/FS report to T11.3 – 6/13/02 02-368v0 John Scheible

Approved as written.

2.2 FS minutes – 6/11/02 02-380v0 Bob Nixon

Approved as written, will remain open until approved at a regular FC-FS meeting.

3. Approval of this agenda: 02-408v0 John Scheible

Bob Nixon requested that the scheduled presentation of 02-398v0 etc. be deferred until the August meeting since the commenter is unable to attend this meeting. Approved as modified.

4. Review of old action items: 02-408v0 John Scheible

4.1 John Scheible to update 02-195v1 with the changes agreed at the FC-FS meeting on 6/11/02.

(Opened 6/11/02) (CLOSED by 02-195v2)

4.2 Bob Nixon to publish a document containing Annex I with the changes proposed in 02-263v0.

(Opened 6/11/02) (CLOSED by 02-398v0)

4.3 Roger Rose to consult with Gary Stephens on how to extend the changes proposed in 02-282v0 to class 4 and with Steve Wilson (Boeing) for class 6.

(Opened 6/11/02)

- 4.4 Roger Rose to publish a revision to 02-282v0 to incorporate changes agreed at the FC-FS meeting on 6/11/02, and class 4 and 6 support if possible.
(Opened 6/11/02)
- 4.5 John Scheible to propose a clarifying rewrite of 6.1 and its subsections.
(Opened 6/11/02)
- 4.6 Craig Carlson to propose a more complete resolution to Qlogic-027 than contained in the comment.
(Opened 6/11/02)

5. Scheduled Business

5.1 ELS Buffer Limitation Proposal 02-195v2 John Scheible

This is a followon from a prior presentation that attempted to resolve issues around the increased size of login and other ELSs. The proposal is to add

- an ELS to negotiate ELS buffering capabilities;
- common and per-class login bits indicating support for the ELS that negotiates ELS buffering capabilities;
- the assumption that the negotiated capabilities carry across logout/login if there are no changes in identity.

The per-class bits were questioned. It was thought that prior discussion did not require this much class-specific support.

Agreed the per-class bits will be removed.

Agreed that a note will be added to clarify that regardless of this ELS-specific buffer negotiation, an R_Rdy still indicates a buffer for a full-sized frame is available (i.e., either the default or the login-negotiated frame size)

Claudio DeSanti questioned the reversion of default buffer size to 128. He felt that the value of 256 legitimized a standard extended login, which was useful; vendor-specific login extension was considered subject to vendor-specific resolution. The group felt the return to 128 was directed by the prior meeting and should not be undone by the very small group at the current meeting; however...

Agreed the note mentioned above will include the clarification that Receive_Buffer_Size is not a constraint on what a sender can send, only a constraint on what the receiver is required to reply to.

Action: John Scheible to update 02-195v2 to include the agreements at the meeting 7/16/02.

5.2 Status of Problem Resolution 02-161v4 John Scheible

02-161v4 shows the status and resolution (if agreed) to all comments received in the T11 letter ballot held in February-March 2002, and in addition, any accepted into consideration subsequently in accord with 02-229v1.

John then led the group in continuing resolution of the technical issues:

- 5.2.1 Akara-005
Accepted.

- 5.2.2 FSI-057**
Pending Qlogic-027.
- 5.2.3 Andiamo-030**
Accepted. A sentence will be added to reference clause 13 for circuit-terminating EOFs.
- 5.2.4 Tivoli-011**
Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.
- 5.2.5 Pirus-015**
Accepted.
- 5.2.6 Andiamo-034**
Accepted.
- 5.2.7 Exabyte-008**
Deferred, no expertise.
- 5.2.8 Vixel-016**
Action: John Scheible to review the format specification of Data_Descriptor frames pursuant to resolving Vixel-016.
- 5.2.9 Pirus-016**
Deferred. no expertise.
- 5.2.10 Pirus-021**
Accepted in principle. A somewhat more specific replacement sentence was constructed.
- 5.2.11 Pirus-024**
Accepted, but the problem is not as commented: The first two sentences are redundant. The first one will be deleted.
- 5.2.12 Vixel-018**
Duplicate of Pirus-021
- 5.2.13 Andiamo-044**
Deferred.
Action: Claudio DeSanti to request from FC-SP a proposal for changes to specify a security header.
- 5.2.14 Pirus-026**
deferred. no expertise
- 5.2.15 Vixel-019**
Accepted.

- 5.2.16 Vixel-020**
Accepted.
- 5.2.17 Vixel-001**
Deferred, interested parties not present
- 5.2.18 Qlogic-038**
deferred. interested parties not present
- 5.2.19 Late-007**
deferred.
Action: John Scheible to review background for Late-007.
- 5.2.20 Qlogic-039**
Deferred to a larger group. The question in the comment was rhetorical, this is a real issue with some well-known addresses.
- 5.2.21 Qlogic-040**
Deferred to a larger group. It was agreed there is an issue, that the issue only pertains in a fabric, and that the eventual resolution needs to allow for implicit flogi. Other issues to be fixed: There is no reference to table 61. Table 61 header should specify N_Port login. Table note 1 may not be necessary, and if retained, needs to get rid of the shall.
- 5.2.22 Tivoli-012**
Accepted. Change "will"s to "should"s
- 5.2.23 Qlogic-041**
Accepted, duplicate of IBM-039.
- 5.2.24 Qlogic-042**
Action: John Scheible to assure discussion of categorization of REC/SRR at the next FC-FS meeting.
Action: Craig Carlson to raise the issue of categorization of REC/SRR with John Lohmeyer.
Action: Bob Nixon to raise the issue of categorization of REC/SRR with T10/FCP-2.
- 5.2.25 IBM-020**
Accepted. Change the qualifier to "optional" (see RSI and RRQ for similar usage). Fix the reply table as well. Remove spurious addition of N to the word numbering in the request table as well.
- 5.2.26 Vixel-021**
defer to larger group
- 5.2.27 IBM-021**
Accepted.

5.2.28 IBM-023

Accepted. The note will be worked into the paragraph above as normative text.

5.2.29 Tivoli-013

Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.

5.2.30 Tivoli-014

Accepted in principle. Change to “may” rather than “shall”

5.2.31 Vixel-026

Accepted.

5.2.32 Qlogic-044

Deferred for group consideration.

Action: Craig Carlson to prepare a proposal for text concerning Qlogic-044 to be inserted in the relevant tables.

5.2.33 Late-017

Accepted. Needs to be 1-255 pages, and minimum of 8 bytes. There are several numbers in the descriptions and tables for RSCN that need to be made consistent with this.

5.2.34 IBM-024

Accepted.

5.2.35 Inrange-026

Rejected. The FARP-REQ has no reply sequence. It is intended to stimulate a FARP_REPLY, however, this is a separate ELS, not an ELS reply.

5.2.36 Inrange-027

Rejected. The FARP-REQ has no ELS response. It is intended to stimulate a FARP_REPLY ELS; however, this is effectively a “ULP” reply, not an ELS reply. The paragraph in question was rewritten to emphasize this.

5.2.37 Brocade-004

Accepted.

5.2.38 Late-018

Accepted. Necessary values (there are 4) are to be derived from table 208.

5.2.39 Emulex-001

Accepted, but verify that the references are the latest.

Action: Bob Nixon to verify that the references associated with Emulex-001 are the latest.

5.2.40 Late-019

Accepted, but verify that the reference is the latest.

Action: Bob Nixon to contact Dave Peterson to determine the latest release of 02-040.

5.2.41 Tivoli-015

Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.

5.2.42 Qlogic-046

Accepted. Proper behavior is in table 26 for all ELSs. Editor will make a global change to eliminate login dependencies from all individual ELS descriptions.

5.2.43 Tivoli-016

Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.

5.2.44 Tivoli-017

Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.

5.2.45 McData-001

Accepted.

5.2.46 Tivoli-026

Accepted in principle. No conflict was seen since the text referring to the management server was limited to registrations for receiving RLIR from the fabric. Registrations for receiving RLIR originated by N_Ports indeed go to the D_ID of the N_Ports. The offending text was clarified however.

5.2.47 Tivoli-027

Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.

5.2.48 Tivoli-028

Accepted the recommended non-normative text change.

5.2.49 Tivoli-029

Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.

5.2.50 Tivoli-032

Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.

5.2.51 Tivoli-033

Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.

5.2.52 Tivoli-034

Defer until class 4 expertise is available.

5.2.53 Tivoli-035

Defer until class 4 expertise is available.

5.2.54 Tivoli-040

Accepted.

5.2.55 Tivoli-041

Accepted.

5.2.56 Tivoli-042

Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.

5.2.57 Qlogic-047

Deferred. Assistance from the originator of the LCLM ELS is needed.

Action: John Scheible to research origin of the LCLM ELS.

5.2.58 Tivoli-043

Accepted, can becomes may

5.2.59 Tivoli-044

Accepted, can becomes may

5.2.60 Qlogic-048

Rejected. The descriptions are intended to represent connection type, not topology.

5.2.61 Qlogic-049

Deferred to a bigger group

5.2.62 Tivoli-046

Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.

5.2.63 Tivoli-048

Deferred to a bigger group

5.2.64 Tivoli-049

Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.

5.2.65 Tivoli-050

Deferred to a bigger group

5.2.66 Tivoli-051

Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.

5.2.67 Tivoli-052

Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.

5.2.68 Boeing-012

Defer for lack of expertise

5.2.69 Exabyte-007

Accepted. Editor will do it globally.

5.2.70 Boeing-013

Defer for lack of expertise

5.2.71 Tivoli-053

Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.

5.2.72 Tivoli-054

Accepted in principle. A different rewording was chosen since the offending phrase describes a situation rather than specifying a rule.

5.2.73 Boeing-014

Defer for lack of expertise

5.2.74 Boeing-015

Defer for lack of expertise

5.2.75 IBM-026

Accepted

5.2.76 Brocade-005

Accepted

5.2.77 Brocade-006

Accepted, with some additional changes.

6. Open action items

6.1 Roger Rose to consult with Gary Stephens on how to extend the changes proposed in 02-282v0 to class 4 and with Steve Wilson (Boeing) for class 6.

(Opened 6/11/02)

6.2 Roger Rose to publish a revision to 02-282v0 to incorporate changes agreed at the FC-FS meeting on 6/11/02, and class 4 and 6 support if possible.

(Opened 6/11/02)

6.3 John Scheible to propose a clarifying rewrite of 6.1 and its subsections.

(Opened 6/11/02)

- 6.4 Craig Carlson to propose a more complete resolution to Qlogic-027 than contained in the comment.

(Opened 6/11/02)

- 6.5 John Scheible to update 02-195v2 to include the agreements at the meeting 7/16/02.

(Opened 7/16/02)

- 6.6 John Scheible to review the format specification of Data_Descriptor frames pursuant to resolving Vixel-016.

(Opened 7/16/02)

- 6.7 Claudio DeSanti to request from FC-SP a proposal for changes to specify a security header.

(Opened 7/16/02)

- 6.8 John Scheible to assure discussion of categorization of REC/SRR at the next FC-FS meeting.

(Opened 7/16/02)

- 6.9 Craig Carlson to raise the issue of categorization of REC/SRR with John Lohmeyer.

(Opened 7/16/02) (Closed 7/16/02)

- 6.10 Bob Nixon to raise the issue of categorization of REC/SRR with T10/FCP-2.

(Opened 7/16/02) (Closed by D. Peterson, see T10/02-267r1)

- 6.11 Craig Carlson to prepare a proposal for text concerning Qlogic-044 to be inserted in the relevant tables.

(Opened 7/16/02)

- 6.12 Bob Nixon to verify that the references associated with Emulex-001 are the latest.

(Opened 7/16/02)

- 6.13 Bob Nixon to contact Dave Peterson to determine the latest release of 02-040.

(Opened 7/16/02)

- 6.14 John Scheible to research origin of the LCLM ELS.

(Opened 7/16/02)

7. Future meeting plans

1 PM to 9 PM Tuesday August 6 has been scheduled at the August T11 plenary week.

8. Adjournment (FS WG)

The meeting was adjourned at 6:12 PM Tuesday July 16, 2002.

9. Attendance

Company Represented	Last Name	First Name	Email
Andiamo Systems	DeSanti	Claudio	cds@andiamo.com
Cisco Systems	Peterson	David	dap@cisco.com
Emulex	Nixon	Bob	bob.nixon@emulex.com
IBM	Scheible	John	jpscheible@aol.com
Qlogic	Carlson	Craig	craig.carlson@qlogic.com
Vixel	Hirata	Ken	khirata@vixel.com