

Draft Minutes
T11.3 FC-FS Working Group Meeting
June 11, 2002 – Rochester, MN
1 PM – 9 PM

A meeting of working group FC-FS of INCITS Technical Committee T11 Task Group T11.3 was held at Rochester, Minnesota on June 11, 2002, in conjunction with the T11 Plenary Week meetings. Attendance at this meeting was 31 people from 28 companies and is tabulated at the end of this document.

Minutes were taken by Bob Nixon (bob.nixon@emulex.com)

1. Opening remarks and introductions: John Scheible

Facilitator John Scheible opened the meeting at 1:00 PM Tuesday, June 11, 2002. He thanked our host company, TrueFocus, and led a round of introductions.

John noted that with completion of the FC-AL-2 amendment, there is no further work proposed for FC-AL-2, and that it will henceforth not be carried in this meeting.

John then indicated that among the rules and policies under which this working group operates are the T11, INCITS, and ANSI patent policies. He directed persons wishing to make statements relevant to those policies to do so at the T11.3 or T11 plenary meeting.

2. Call for changes to minutes

2.1 AL-2/FS report to T11.3 – 4/11/02 02-233v0 John Scheible
Approved as written.

2.2 AL-2/FS minutes – 4/09/02 02-242v1 Bob Nixon
In email 4/19/2002, Ralph Weber pointed out that in 6.5.5, the reference to “10.4.1” should be “4.10.1”. On closer examination, the paragraph of reference is not specified, either. It should say "Remove the last sentence of the second paragraph of 4.10.1"
Approved as corrected.

3. Approval of this agenda: 02-292v0 John Scheible
The presenter of Solution to Exabye-008 should be Roger Rose.
Approved as corrected.

4. Review of old action items: 02-292v0 John Scheible

4.1 AL/2 Action Items - none

4.2 FS Action Items

- 4.2.1 Bob Nixon to notify Dave Peterson that the language about LOGI size may be inconsistent with the general case of Vendor Specific LOGI extensions.
(Opened 4/9/02)(CLOSED by email 4/17/02 and 02-256v0)
- 4.2.2 John Scheible to consult Bob Snively concerning Boeing-001 proposal to allow intermix in Class 6
(Opened 4/9/02)(CLOSED by email 5/28/02)
- 4.2.3 Editor to correct uses of "The Login protocol" which may refer to implicit login and therefore should be simply "Login".
(Opened 4/9/02)(CLOSED by 02-291v0)
- 4.2.4 Facilitator to decide if a late comment is required to capitalize the letters a-h in columns 2 and 6 of table 5.
(Opened 4/9/02)(CLOSED by 02-291v0)

5. Scheduled Business

5.1 Status of the FS document 02-247v0 John Scheible

John reported that he was able to recover the source files from Jim Nelson for both 1.7 and a tentative 1.8 of FC-FS.

There being no answer to the call for a new editor, John volunteered as master editor, and expects to farm out the detailed work.

5.2 ELS Buffer Limitation Proposal 02-195v1 John Scheible

This is a followon from a prior presentation that attempted to resolve issues around the increased size of login and other ELSs. The proposal is to add

- an ELS to negotiate ELS buffering capabilities;
- a login bit indicating support for the ELS that negotiates ELS buffering capabilities;
- the assumption that the negotiated capabilities carry across logout/login.

Bill Martin pointed out that the capabilities relevant to login can not unconditionally carry over, since the identity is not determined until login is processed.

The new ELS was proposed to be allowed outside of login. This was not completely comfortable since outside of login, it may not be known if the other end supports it.

It was agreed that the data buffer size area should be removed from the new ELS.

It was agreed that for each class, the size of ELSs sent in that class should be limited by the smaller of the class frame size negotiated at login and the ELS frame size negotiated by the new ELS (if any).

It was agreed that the maximum ELS frame size that shall be supported outside of login negotiations shall return to 128 or greater.

It was agreed that the term "Receive Data Field Size" shall be consistently used in this specification change.

It was agreed that to use logins greater than 128, a port should log in with the basic login payload, then send the new ELS if needed, then login again with the extended format.

The ELS size will pertain for the second login, though not subsequent to any other explicit or implicit logouts.

It was agreed that the new ELS shall require login.

It was agreed that the conditions negotiated by the new ELS apply precisely to those frames having R_CTL values indicative of ELS.

Action: John Scheible to update 02-195v1 with the changes agreed at the FC-FS meeting on 6/11/02.

5.3 Resolution cmts on Annex I 02-262v0 Bob Nixon

02-262v0 proposes resolutions to all comments against Annex I. It indicates exact changes except for the proposals with widespread impact. 02-263v0 is a pdf markup of Annex I indicating all changes as a result of all proposals. The commenter preferred to see the fully modified text before finally accepting the proposed resolutions.

Action: Bob Nixon to publish a document containing Annex I with the changes proposed in 02-263v0.

5.4 Solution to Exabyte-008 02-282v0 Roger Rose

Roger proposed revised text for classes 1, 2, and 3, but not classes 4 and 6, which were beyond his claim of expertise.

Some strictly editorial changes were requested.

It was agreed that the trigger for changing RXID from FFFF is not strictly the assignment of an alternative RXID. The last sentences of the second paragraphs of the proposed changes for classes 1, 2, and 3 were stricken.

Action: Roger Rose to consult with Gary Stephens on how to extend the changes proposed in 02-282v0 to class 4 and with Steve Wilson (Boeing) for class 6.

Action: Roger Rose to publish a revision to 02-282v0 to incorporate changes agreed at the FC-FS meeting on 6/11/02, and class 4 and 6 support if possible.

5.5 Status of Problem Resolution 02-161v2 John Scheible

02-161v2 shows the status and resolution (if agreed) to all comments received in the T11 letter ballot held in February-March 2002, and in addition, any accepted into consideration subsequently in accord with 02-229v1. John has added proposed resolutions to most of the editorial comments (over 200). These were posted for open review two weeks prior to this meeting.

The editorial changes in 02-161v2 were accepted without objection.

John then led the group in continuing resolution of the technical issues:

5.5.1 Andiamo-005

Accepted. Was open since last meeting for study. Study supported the proposed resolution.

5.5.2 Boeing-001

Accepted. Was open since last meeting for study. Study did not contradict the proposed resolution.

5.5.3 FSI-040

Accepted in principle. Accept proposed change to first sentence. Remove second sentence entirely. The sentence refers to an object for which there is no term, and it adds little value.

- 5.5.4 FSI-043**
Accepted.
- 5.5.5 FSI-044**
Accepted. All primitive signals except R_RDY shall be treated as IDLE if not supported.
- 5.5.6 Pirus-007**
Accepted. Check for and fix other instances similar to the one identified.
- 5.5.7 FSI-045**
Accepted.
- 5.5.8 FSI-046**
Accepted. All current ones are mandatory. All AL-2 ones are mandatory for L_Ports.
- 5.5.9 Andiamo-023**
Open pending John Scheible rewrite. The intent is that for detection of loss of sync, two good words cancel a bad one. But the presentation is very confusing.
Action: John Scheible to propose a clarifying rewrite of 6.1 and its subsections.
- 5.5.10 Andiamo-024**
Open pending Andiamo-023.
- 5.5.11 Tivoli-007**
Accepted in principle. The word and another nearby are statements of fact, not normative rules.
- 5.5.12 Tivoli-008**
Accepted. Changed to statements of fact rather than rules
- 5.5.13 Tivoli-009**
Accepted.
- 5.5.14 Brocade-001**
Open pending Andiamo-023.
- 5.5.15 Andiamo-025**
Open pending Andiamo-023.
- 5.5.16 Andiamo-026**
Open pending Andiamo-023.
- 5.5.17 Inrange-015**
Accepted.
- 5.5.18 Andiamo-028**
Accepted.

- 5.5.19 Pirus-011**
Accepted.
- 5.5.20 Tivoli-010**
Accepted.
- 5.5.21 FSI-049**
Accepted.
- 5.5.22 FSI-051**
Accepted.
- 5.5.23 FSI-055**
Accepted.
- 5.5.24 Qlogic-027**
Open.
Action: Craig Carlson to propose a more complete resolution to Qlogic-027 than contained in the comment.
- 5.5.25 FSI-057**
Open, see Qlogic-027.

6. Review of new action items

- 6.1 John Scheible to update 02-195v1 with the changes agreed at the FC-FS meeting on 6/11/02.
(Opened 6/11/02) (CLOSED by 02-195v2)
- 6.2 Bob Nixon to publish a document containing Annex I with the changes proposed in 02-263v0.
(Opened 6/11/02)
- 6.3 Roger Rose to consult with Gary Stephens on how to extend the changes proposed in 02-282v0 to class 4 and with Steve Wilson (Boeing) for class 6.
(Opened 6/11/02)
- 6.4 Roger Rose to publish a revision to 02-282v0 to incorporate changes agreed at the FC-FS meeting on 6/11/02, and class 4 and 6 support if possible.
(Opened 6/11/02)
- 6.5 John Scheible to propose a clarifying rewrite of 6.1 and its subsections.
(Opened 6/11/02)
- 6.6 Craig Carlson to propose a more complete resolution to Qlogic-027 than contained in the comment.
(Opened 6/11/02)

7. Future meeting plans

8 hours will be requested at the July T10 meeting.

As much time as possible will be requested at the August T11 plenary week.

8. Adjournment (FS WG)

The meeting was adjourned at 6:12 PM Tuesday June 11, 2002.

9. Attendance

Company Represented	Last Name	First Name	Email
Akara	Wanamaker	Neil	nwanamaker@akara.com
Andiamo Systems	DeSanti	Claudio	cds@andiamo.com
Brocade	Martin	William R.	bmartin@brocade.com
Cisco Systems	Peterson	David	dap@cisco.com
DDC	Gelish	Joseph	gelish@ddc-web
Emulex	Nixon	Bob	bob.nixon@emulex.com
ENDL Texas	Weber	Ralph	roweber@acm.org
Exabyte	Rose	Roger	rogerr@exabyte.com
Fujitsu	Fitzpatrick	Mike	mfitzpatrick@fcpa.fujitsu.com
General Dynamics	Pedersen	Robert K.	robert.pedersen@gd-ais.com
IBM	Scheible	John	jpscheible@aol.com
IBM - Tivoli	Penokie	George	gop@us.ibm.com
I-Tech	Mastro	Jeff	jmm@i-tech.com
I-Tech	Wirtz	Steve	steve_wirtz@i-tech.com
JNI	Colpaart	Dirk	dcolpaart@jni.com
LSI Logic	Lohmeyer	John	lohmeyer@t10.org
LSI Logic	Miquelon	Mark	mark.miquelon@lsil.com
Malachite	Sheehan	Tim	tsheehan@malachitetech.com
McData	Hofer	Larry	larry.hofer@mcddata.com
MTI	Ramos	Rich	rich@chi.mti.com
Nishan	Monia	Charles	cmonia@nishansystems.com
PMC-Sierra	Bergstrom	April	april_bergstrom@pmc-sierra.com
QLogic	McGlaughlin	Ed	ed.mcgloughlin@qlogic.com
Sancastle	Talluto	Dennis	dtalluto@sancastle.com
Sanera Systems	Maunder	Anurag	amaunder@sanera.net
Seagate	Coomes	James	jim_coomes@seagate.com
StorageTek	Gaffney	Matt	matt_gaffney@stortek.com
Systran	Fearday	Alan	afearday@systran.com
True Focus	Trustedt	Horst	hotrues@attglobal.net
Unisys	Gentry	Wayne	wayne.gentry@unisys.com
Vixel	Hirata	Ken	khirata@vixel.com

